AMNESTY INTERNATIONAL PUBLIC STATEMENT

6 May 2020 MDE 21/2248/2020

STATE OF PALESTINE: AUTHORITIES MUST END ARBITRARY DETENTION OF CRITICS AMID CORONAVIRUS OUTBREAK

The Fatah-led Palestinian authorities in the West Bank and the Hamas de facto administration in the Gaza Strip have arbitrarily detained critics amid the coronavirus (COVID-19) outbreak, Amnesty International said today, calling on both authorities to immediately and unconditionally release all those detained solely for peacefully expressing their opinions, however critical of the president or other public figures or institutions, and drop charges imposed on others for the same reason.

Amnesty International has documented five cases of individuals who were arrested by Palestinian security forces in either the Gaza Strip or the West Bank in March or April 2020 after they criticized the authorities on social media or conducted other online activities, concluding that they were detained solely for peacefully exercising their right to freedom of expression. All were arrested during the state of emergency which the Palestinian authorities, both in the Gaza Strip and the West Bank, put in place to address the COVID-19 pandemic at the beginning of March. In one case, the criticism directly related to the authorities’ response to the COVID-19 crisis; in the other cases it did not. Some have been released; others remain in detention. As part of its research, Amnesty International spoke to former detainees, families of detainees, lawyers and local human rights organizations.

These arrests undermine welcome measures taken by the Palestinian authorities in the West Bank and the Gaza Strip to release some prisoners and detainees as part of their response to the public health crisis. They also come in the context of a pre-existing pattern of violations of the right to freedom of expression by the Palestinian authorities in both the Gaza Strip and West Bank.

ARBITRARY DETentions IN WEST BANK

The Fatah-led Palestinian authorities in the West Bank have violated the right to freedom of expression amid the COVID-19 outbreak. According to Lawyers for Justice, a group of lawyers who provide legal counsel to victims of human rights violations in the Occupied Palestinian Territories, there has been an increase in cases of politically motivated arrests in the West Bank since the outbreak of COVID-19.¹ The group says it has represented 10 individuals arrested by the Palestinian authorities in the West Bank since the beginning of March solely for practising their rights to freedom of expression and/or association. One of these individuals, Zakaria Khuwaylid, was arrested in April 2020 after expressing opinions critical of the Palestinian president’s response to the COVID-19 outbreak. Amnesty International has documented his case and that of Hussam Khader, who was arrested in March 2020 after he, too, criticized the Palestinian president, although not in relation to the government’s handling of the COVID-19 crisis.

These arrests come in the context of a pre-existing pattern of violations of the right to freedom of expression by the Fatah-led Palestinian authorities in the West Bank. According to the Palestinian Center for Development and Media Freedoms (MADA), a press freedom NGO, the Palestinian authorities in the West Bank were responsible for at least eight violations against journalists and other media workers in the first quarter of 2020.² These included arbitrary arrests, physical assaults, confiscation of equipment and bans on reporting. The Independent Commission for Human Rights (ICHR), the Palestinian national human rights institution, reported that it had received five complaints of violations by the Palestinian

1 Telephone interview with Lawyers for Justice, 22 April 2020. For more information on the group, see Lawyers for Justice, lawyers4justice.ps/about-us/ (accessed on 4 May 2020). Lawyers for Justice has also noted that, in some instances, lawyers are unable to submit urgent applications for the release of their clients due to intermittent closures of courts related to the COVID-19 outbreak, leaving those arrested in pre-trial detention for prolonged periods of time.

authorities in the West Bank of the rights to freedom of opinion, expression and peaceful assembly during the first quarter of 2020.3

HUSAM KHADER, BALATA REFUGEE CAMP

On 6 March, at around 12.30am, a few hours after the Palestinian president’s declaration of the state of emergency, former Fatah member of parliament Husam Khader, 58, was arrested at his house in the Balata refugee camp near the city of Nablus. According to his son, Ahmad Khader, around 25-30 vehicles belonging to the Joint Security Committee, a unit comprising members of different security forces, surrounded the house and officers from those vehicles then summoned Husam Khader.

Husam Khader’s detention came after he posted a message on Facebook on 1 March criticizing Palestinian President Mahmoud Abbas for a comment he had made on 1 March describing a strike that the Palestinian Medical Association was undertaking at the time as “despicable”. The strike had begun on 16 February and was related to issues that predated the COVID-19 outbreak. Ahmad Khader told Amnesty International that his father was initially taken to al-Junaid prison in Nablus and then transferred to the Preventative Security detention centre in the city of Beitunia, near Ramallah. Husam Khader was charged with “insulting the president under Article 188 of the 1960 Penal Code in force in the West Bank. He was released on 9 March 2020 after the charges against him were dropped. Amnesty International considers that Husam Khader was detained arbitrarily.

ZAKARIA KHUWAYLID, TULKAREM

On 14 April, at around 12.30am, Zakaria Khuwaylid, 22, from the city of Tulkarem, in the north-west of the West Bank, was arrested by 12 security officers belonging to the General Intelligence Service (GIS), who stormed into his house and presented him with an arrest warrant. His arrest came after he made a comment on a Facebook page criticizing Palestinian President Mahmoud Abbas’ response to the COVID-19 crisis. He told Amnesty International that, following his arrest, he was taken to a detention centre inside the GIS headquarters in Tulkarem, where interrogators questioned him for over four hours about the comment he had made on Facebook. He was then questioned by public prosecutors who took his testimony in the same GIS headquarters.

“After the interrogation ended, I was put in a room with three other prisoners. The room was small and very dirty and we were living with cockroaches. The toilet was very dirty and I was even afraid to take a shower in it. My arrest comes during a sensitive time when everyone is talking about the COVID-19 crisis, but the prison clearly did not adhere to any hygiene standards,” Zakaria Khuwaylid told Amnesty International.

Zakaria Khuwaylid was charged with “defamation” under Article 191 of the 1960 Penal Code. On 16 April, the Tulkarem magistrate court extended his detention for another 15 days. On 19 April, Zakaria Khuwaylid’s lawyer, Ahmad Barham, submitted an application to the court for his release on bail. On 21 April, Zakaria Khuwaylid was released after making a bail payment of 150 Jordanian dinars (US$210).

Amnesty International considers that Zakaria Khuwaylid was detained arbitrarily. It also believes that the charge of “defamation” is baseless and should be dropped immediately. Defamation and libel, whether of public figures or private individuals, should never be criminal offences; an individual who believes that their reputation has been harmed may seek redress through civil proceedings. Laws that prohibit insults or other forms of disrespect towards heads of state and other public figures or government institutions are contrary to international human rights law and standards.

ARBITRARY DETENTIONS IN GAZA STRIP

The Hamas de facto administration in the Gaza Strip has also violated the right to freedom of expression amid the COVID-19 outbreak. Amnesty International has documented three cases of individuals arrested in March-April 2020 in relation to


4 Husam Khader, Facebook post, 2 March 2020, www.facebook.com/permalink.php?story_fbid=2588023838150290&id=100008280968055 (in Arabic). President Mahmoud Abbas’ comment on the strike was widely reported in Palestinian media. See, for example, Wattan, “Doctor’s syndicate to Wattan: Our demands are legal and we will not give up on them… Our dignity cannot be violated”, 3 March 2020, www.wattan.net/ar/video/303375.html (in Arabic).

5 Telephone interview with Zakaria Khuwaylid, 23 April 2020.
their criticism of the Hamas authorities on social media or other online activities that displeased the authorities. It has concluded that they were all detained arbitrarily.

These arrests come in the context of a pre-existing pattern of violations of the right to freedom of expression by the Hamas de facto administration in the Gaza Strip. According to MADA, the Hamas de facto administration has been responsible for at least 10 violations against journalists and other media workers since the beginning of the year. These included arbitrary arrests, physical assaults, confiscation of equipment and bans on reporting. A recent attack was on 25 April, when, according to the Palestinian Center for Human Rights (PCHR), police in Gaza arrested members of a Palestine TV crew who were recording an interview in the Jabalia refugee camp in the northern Gaza Strip, claiming that they did not have the authorization for filming and conducting interviews. The ICHR also received three complaints of violations by the Palestinian authorities in the Gaza Strip of the rights to freedom of opinion, expression and peaceful assembly during the first quarter of 2020. 

ABDULLAH ABU SHARKH, JABALIA REFUGEE CAMP

On 13 March, a police force arrested writer Abdullah Abu Sharkh, 60, from his home in the Jabalia refugee camp in the northern Gaza Strip. Abdullah Abu Sharkh told Amnesty International that, at around 10.15pm, seven or eight uniformed armed police officers stormed into his house and arrested him without presenting an arrest warrant. Officers transferred Abdullah Abu Sharkh to Jabalia’s police station and interrogated him for around two hours about social media posts of his that were critical of the Hamas authorities. He told Amnesty International that interrogators questioned him particularly about a Facebook post in which he insinuated that the Izz al-Din al-Qassam Brigades, Hamas’ military wing, were behind a fire that broke out on 5 March 2020 in a bakery in the Nuseirat refugee camp in the central Gaza Strip and resulted in the death of 25 Palestinians, and that the motive was that the owner of the bakery had refused to supply them with free bread.

According to Abdullah Abu Sharkh, he deleted the Facebook post less than seven minutes after making it public. Despite that, the public prosecutor’s office charged him with “spreading false news” and “misuse of technology” under, respectively, Article 62 and Article 262 of the 1963 Penal Code, which the Hamas authorities often use as a basis for arresting and prosecuting activists for social media posts, particularly ones critical of them.

On 16 March, Abdullah Abu Sharkh was brought before a magistrate court, which ordered his detention to be extended by 15 days. He was subsequently transferred to Abu Ubaida prison in northern Gaza. According to his lawyer, Ihsan Abu Sharkh, an application to the court to release Abdullah Abu Sharkh on bail was rejected on 23 March and he was kept in detention for 10 days after the 15-day extension order expired on 30 March.

On 2 April, the ICHR visited Abdullah Abu Sharkh while in detention and called on the public prosecutor in the Gaza Strip to immediately release him as his continued detention during the COVID-19 pandemic constituted a threat to his life.

Abdullah Abu Sharkh was released on 9 April, following an order from the public prosecutor’s office, which failed to clarify the reason behind his release. His lawyer told Amnesty International that to date it is unclear whether the charges against him were dropped or he was released as a preventive measure to stop the spread of COVID-19.

According to Abdullah Abu Sharkh, he had been arrested by Hamas authorities for publishing his opinions on social media on five previous occasions, most recently in 2018. He told Amnesty International, “I have the right to express my opinion as long as it’s not hurting others. This continued targeting is clearly an attack against my right to freely express

---


myself and it must stop. All international human rights treaties grant me this right and I should not be prosecuted for practising it.”

Amnesty International considers that Abdullah Abu Sharkh was detained arbitrarily.

**ISMAEL EL-BOZOM, JABALIA REFUGEE CAMP**

On 20 March 2020, officers from Gaza’s General Investigation Unit (GIU), a division of the police department, arrested cartoonist Ismael el-Bozom, 33, at his home in the Jabalia refugee camp in the northern Gaza Strip. He told Amnesty International that, at around 6pm, two officers arrested him at his house without presenting an arrest warrant. He was subsequently taken to the police station in Jabalia, where an officer from the GIU told him that he was being arrested following a complaint submitted to the public prosecutor’s office in Gaza. He said that officers interrogated him about political drawings of his that are critical of the Hamas authorities and about a Facebook post he had shared calling for the release of Palestinian writer Abdullah Abu Sharkh. Ismael el-Bozom told Amnesty International that he often publishes his political drawings on social media platforms, including his Facebook page.

On 22 March, Ismael el-Bozom was released without charge after he signed a pledge that requires him to present himself to the authorities when summoned. On 23 March, Ismael el-Bozom posted a message on Facebook to say that the public prosecutor’s office informed him that no warrant had been issued for his arrest and that he would file a complaint with the office to seek an investigation into whether he had been arrested illegally.

Ismael el-Bozom failed to present himself to the authorities following a summons from the GIU that he received on 25 March. He was arrested again on 26 March after a number of uniformed armed security force officers stormed into his home, according to him. He was taken to the police station in Jabalia and kept there for three days without being interrogated or presented to a judge. He was released without charge on 29 March as part of a measure to prevent the spread of COVID-19 among detainees.

According to Ismael el-Bozom, he has been arrested five times since 2017 by the Hamas authorities based in Gaza, on each occasion in connection with his political cartoons and writings, which are critical of Hamas.

Amnesty International considers that Ismael el-Bozom was detained arbitrarily.

**RAMI AMAN, GAZA CITY**

On 9 April, security forces belonging to the Hamas de facto administration in Gaza arrested Rami Aman, 38, a resident of al-Rimal neighbourhood in Gaza City, after he organized a video call on 6 April with a group of Israelis to answer questions about life in Gaza, on which Israel has imposed an illegal blockade for the past 12 years, amid the COVID-19 pandemic. According to a family member, the authorities had called Rami Aman’s phone earlier in the day and summoned him to Ansar prison in Gaza City, where he was arrested. On the day of his arrest, the spokesperson of Gaza’s Ministry of Interior issued a statement saying that Rami Aman and other individuals who participated in the video call he organized were arrested on the orders of the military prosecution for establishing “normalization activities with the Israeli occupation via the internet, which is a punishable crime by law”.

According to Rami Aman’s family, since his arrest, they have only been able to speak to him on one occasion, which was by telephone on 26 April. Rami Aman’s lawyer, Mohammed Alami of the PCHR, visited him for the first time on 16 April. Mohammed Alami told Amnesty International that Rami Aman is still under investigation and has not been brought before a judge, but is likely to be charged under Article 164 of the Palestinian Liberation Organization (PLO) Revolutionary Penal Code of 1979, which refers to “propaganda aimed at weakening the revolution”. On 19 April, Mohammed Alami submitted a request to the military prosecution to release Aman on bail, but it has not responded yet.

Rami Aman and the other activists are likely to be brought before a military court in Gaza; military courts have jurisdiction over cases involving members of the security forces, members of Palestinian factions and their military wings, as well as persons suspected of collaboration with Israel. Palestinian human rights groups in Gaza have refused to represent

---

15 State of Palestine Ministry of Interior and National Security, Statement: Arrest of participants in normalization activities with occupier over internet, 9 April 2020, moi.gov.ps/Home/Post/128710?fbclid=IwAR0_1mjuvos3ahYVJoCuH12oTCZm47DDB5er_YuJXdiICSE528BSKeXDw (in Arabic).
detainees before military courts because they consider them illegitimate. Over recent years, Amnesty International has raised with the Hamas de facto administration its grave concerns that Hamas’ use of military courts to try civilians in Gaza fails to adhere to international fair trial standards and that it has sometimes deployed them as an arm of the executive in an attempt to silence criticism of the authorities.

Rami Aman was previously arrested in July 2019 and held for over two weeks for organizing an Israeli group, “rides for peace” in which Palestinians in Gaza and Israelis in Israel simultaneously went on bicycle rides.

Amnesty International considers Rami Aman, along with those arrested with him, to be detained solely for peacefully exercising their right to freedom of expression and therefore prisoner of consciences who should be released immediately and unconditionally.

**MEASURES TO ADDRESS COVID-19**

On 5 March 2020, when the first cases of COVID-19 were confirmed in the occupied West Bank city of Bethlehem, the Ramallah-based Palestinian authorities launched national containment measures to contain the spread of the virus. On the same day, Palestinian President Mahmoud Abbas issued a decree declaring a 30-day state of emergency, which was extended for 30 days on 3 April and another 30 days on 5 May. Under the State of Palestine’s Basic Law, its interim constitution, a state of emergency may be declared by a presidential decree in response to exceptional circumstances that threaten national security, including a pandemic, for a period not exceeding 30 days, and may be renewed for another 30 days with the approval of two thirds of the Palestinian Legislative Council members. In the absence of a functioning council, as is currently the case, the state of emergency is currently renewed by a presidential decree without parliamentary oversight.

On 22 March, in an effort to contain the spread of the virus in prisons, President Abbas granted clemency to some prisoners convicted of felonies or misdemeanours who had served at least half of their prison sentence. On 5 April, the spokesperson for the Palestinian presidency announced that 125 convicted prisoners held in prisons in the West Bank were pardoned. The pardon excluded prisoners convicted of certain offences such as collaboration with Israel, disturbing public order and indecent assault, even if they had served at least half of their sentences. Amnesty International has, over the years, documented cases in which charges such as “disturbing public order” have been used to convict individuals solely for expressing views that are critical of the Palestinian authorities.

On 11 March, the Ministry of Interior spokesperson in the Gaza de facto administration, Eyad al-Bozom, issued a statement announcing measures to contain the spread of the virus in the Gaza Strip. On 17 March, the spokesperson issued a statement announcing the release of 957 prisoners and detainees. According to the statement, 870 of them were granted leave from detention until further notice and 87 were granted clemency after having served two thirds of their prison sentence.

According to the International Committee of the Red Cross, prison populations are particularly exposed to infectious diseases like COVID-19 and conditions of detention can exacerbate the risks. These include the risk of higher transmission rates, especially in overcrowded prisons and when health systems are of poorer quality than in the community. Older people and those with underlying medical conditions, including those with a weakened immune system, are at particular risk. Amnesty International therefore welcomes measures to reduce the prison population so far as they reduce these risks and thereby help guarantee the right to health. However, it is concerned that existing and new detentions of individuals who should never have been in custody in the first place undermine those measures.

**INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW AND STANDARDS**


The State of Palestine is a party to the main international human rights treaties, including the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and the UN Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment. As such, the authorities are obligated to uphold the rights to liberty and security of person, freedom of expression and peaceful assembly, and the absolute prohibition of torture and other ill-treatment. The State of Palestine’s Basic Law limits the authorities’ ability to restrict these rights during a state of emergency, stating: “It is not allowed to impose restrictions on fundamental rights and freedoms when declaring a state of emergency except to the extent necessary to fulfill the purpose stated in the decree declaring the state of emergency.”

Hamas runs the de facto administration of the Gaza Strip and therefore has a duty, according to international law, to ensure that the human rights of individuals under its jurisdiction are protected. Accordingly, it has the duty to uphold the rights to freedom of expression and peaceful assembly.

While public health may be invoked as a ground for limiting the right to freedom of expression in order to allow a state to take measures dealing with a serious threat to the health of the population, such measures must be provided by law and be necessary, proportionate and specifically aimed at a relevant legitimate purpose, such as preventing the spread of or otherwise addressing a disease like COVID-19, or providing care for the sick.

**RECOMMENDATIONS**

Amnesty International calls on the Fatah-led authorities in the West Bank and the Hamas de facto administration in the Gaza Strip to:

- Immediately halt violations of the right to freedom of expression, in particular arbitrary detentions, and ensure that restrictions are not used as a pretext to suppress information that might be uncomfortable for the authorities or clamp down on their critics;
- Immediately and unconditionally release all those who have been detained solely for peacefully expressing their views and are therefore prisoners of conscience;
- Ensure that all detention facilities are equipped with sufficient and functioning sanitizing and other relevant facilities for physical hygiene, and that all detainees are regularly provided free of charge with adequate quantities of soap and other sanitizing items and access to clean running water;
- Ensure, more generally, that international human rights law and standards are at the centre of all responses to COVID-19, in order to best protect public health and support people who are most at risk of adverse impacts.

---
