Introduction

In September 1993, the Constitution of the Kingdom of Cambodia was promulgated, formally bringing to an end the mandate of the United Nations Transitional Authority in Cambodia (UNTAC). Following elections organised by UNTAC in May, a new constitution was drawn up by the National Provisional Government and adopted by the Constituent Assembly, establishing Cambodia as a constitutional monarchy.

Amnesty International welcomes several provisions in the Constitution designed to ensure respect for human rights as laid down in the United Nations Universal Declaration of Human Rights, and related international instruments. However, Amnesty International is concerned that the provisions made for the safeguarding of human rights under the Constitution, which was not subject to public scrutiny or debate prior to its promulgation, are inadequate for effectively protecting some fundamental rights and freedoms of significant sections of the population. The text of the Constitution provides human rights guarantees only to ‘Khmer citizens’ or ‘Khmer people’ and therefore, many people from ethnic minority groups who do not qualify for Khmer (Cambodian) citizenship are not covered by the human rights provisions in the Constitution. Amnesty International is further concerned that without a comprehensive reform of the judicial system in the country, the constitutional guarantees which are in place cannot be enforced. Included in this document are several recommendations addressed to the Royal Government of Cambodia and the United Nations by Amnesty International, which are designed to improve the protection of human rights in Cambodia.

Amnesty International is a worldwide movement which is independent of any government, ideology, political grouping or religious creed. Amnesty International’s work is based on the principles set forth in the United Nations Universal Declaration of Human Rights, which apply to all people. Amnesty International seeks the release of prisoners of conscience, that is, people detained anywhere for their beliefs, colour, sex, ethnic origin, language or religion, who have not used or advocated violence. Amnesty International works for fair and prompt trials for all political prisoners, and on behalf of such people detained without charge or trial. It opposes the death penalty, torture and other forms of cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment of all prisoners. Amnesty International also campaigns against ‘disappearances’ and extra-judicial executions. Amnesty International takes no position on the political orientation of any government and is solely concerned with the promotion and protection of human rights.

On various occasions in the past, Amnesty International has submitted recommendations to authorities involved in preparing constitutions, in order to ensure that
adequate safeguards to protect internationally guaranteed human rights are reflected in constitutional provisions. A constitution in and of itself can never be sufficient to prevent human rights violations. However, a constitution which includes strong guarantees for the protection of fundamental human rights and freedoms can be a powerful tool in preventing human rights abuses. In the case of Cambodia, where human rights abuses by governments and armed opposition groups have been widespread for over twenty years, the need for strong guarantees is paramount.

**Background**

The Vietnamese army invaded Cambodia in December 1978 bringing to an end the rule of the Government of Democratic Kampuchea (Khmer Rouge). There followed a period of war and foreign occupation until September 1989 when the Vietnamese army withdrew from Cambodia. Civil war between the rival Cambodian factions continued until October 1991, when the four factions involved in the Cambodian conflict, signed an Agreement on a Comprehensive Political Settlement of the Cambodia Conflict, commonly known as the Paris Peace Agreements. Under the terms of these agreements, the United Nations (UN) was given temporary authority to take over the administrative functions of the government in Cambodia, supervise the relocation of each faction’s armed forces to designated cantonment areas, and the subsequent demobilization of 70 percent of these armed forces, and organise democratic elections in the country. The Paris Peace Agreements also required UNTAC to make provisions for:

“(a) The development and implementation of a programme of human rights education to promote respect for and understanding of human rights;

(b) General human rights oversight during the transitional period;

(c) The investigation of human rights complaints, and where appropriate, corrective action.”

In order to fulfil this part of its mandate, the UNTAC human rights component worked to promote the development of local human rights groups, and stationed human

---

1 These factions were the State of Cambodia Government (SOC); the Partie of Democratic Kampuchea (PDK), usually known as the Khmer Rouge; The National United Front for an Independent, Neutral, Peaceful and Cooperative Cambodia (known by its French acronym as FUNCINPEC); and the Khmer People's National Liberation Front (KPNLF). The PDK, FUNCINPEC and the KPNLF had been engaged in armed opposition to the SOC Government since its installation following the Vietnamese army's invasion of Cambodia in 1979.

2 Eighteen countries signed the Paris Peace Agreements in addition to the four Cambodian factions, namely: Australia, Brunei, Canada, China, France, India, Indonesia, Japan, Laos, Malaysia, New Zealand, the Philippines, Russia, Singapore, Thailand, Viet Nam, the United Kingdom, the USA.
KINGDOM OF CAMBODIA Human rights and the new constitution

Amnesty International January 1994
AI Index: ASA 23/01/94

rights monitors in every province in Cambodia. This was the first time that the UN had undertaken such a programme of human rights education, monitoring and action.

Cambodian sovereignty during the period of the UNTAC mandate was embodied in the Supreme National Council (SNC), with Prince Norodom Sihanouk as the Chairman. The SNC had 12 members, six of whom represented the State of Cambodia Government (SOC), with two members representing the National United Front for an Independent, Neutral, Peaceful and Cooperative Cambodia (FUNCINPEC), two representing the Partie of Democratic Kampuchea (PDK or Khmer Rouge) and two more representing the Khmer People's National Liberation Front (KPNLF). The SNC acceded to most of the major human rights instruments in 1992, including the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, (ICCPR) the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, the 1951 Convention relating to the Status of Refugees and its 1967 Protocol and the Convention on the Rights of the Child. However, accession to these treaties, and the presence of UNTAC human rights officers throughout the country, did not prevent widespread human rights violations taking place, including political assassinations and extra-judicial executions of civilians, frequently targeting members of ethnic minority groups.3

Implementation of the Paris Peace Agreements proved difficult and ceasefire violations were frequent for the duration of UNTAC's mandate. The SOC Government was reluctant to allow UNTAC access to the key areas of civil administration provided for by the Paris Peace Agreements, while the PDK refused to cooperate in the process of relocation to cantonment areas and demobilization of its armed forces. The detention of political prisoners was banned by the Peace Agreements, and all factions appeared to comply with this, but assassination of political opponents was commonplace. In April 1993 the PDK withdrew from the SNC, removed its representatives from Phnom Penh, and ceased its limited cooperation with UNTAC. Having already boycotted the voter registration procedures operated by UNTAC, the PDK then threatened to disrupt the elections, in which they refused to field any candidates. However, in spite of these threats, democratic elections organised by UNTAC went ahead in May with a high voter turnout, resulting in a narrow victory for the royalist party FUNCINPEC, led by Prince Norodom Ranariddh, son of Prince Sihanouk. The Cambodian People's Party (CPP), which had formed the SOC Government, came second, and a coalition Provisional National Government was formed by FUNCINPEC, the CPP and the smaller Buddhist Liberal Democratic Party (BLDP), charged with drawing up a new constitution for Cambodia, as laid down in the Paris Peace Agreements. The new constitution was drafted in camera by a small committee of elected

3 For details of these abuses, see Amnesty International Reports: Cambodia: Human Rights Developments, 1 October 1991 to 31 January 1992 (ASA 23/12/92); State of Cambodia: Update on human rights concerns (ASA 23/04/92); Cambodia: Human rights concerns July to December 1992 (ASA 23/01/93); and Cambodia: Arbitrary killings of ethnic Vietnamese (ASA 23/05/93).
members of the Constituent Assembly from July to September. There was very little opportunity for interested parties, including the members of the Constituent Assembly, the local population and human rights groups to have any input into the drafting process. Suggestions by UNTAC that the drafting process should be one of open consultation were rejected by the Provisional National Government.

The Constitution

The new Constitution establishes a constitutional monarchy in Cambodia, where the "king reigns but does not wield power". Under the terms of the new Constitution, the king of Cambodia shall guarantee respect for the rights and freedoms of the people. Annex 5, Article 2 of the Paris Peace Agreements required that the new constitution contain a declaration of fundamental rights. The Peace Agreements state that:

"Cambodia's tragic recent history requires special measures to assure protection of human rights. Therefore, the constitution will contain a declaration of fundamental rights, including the rights to life, personal liberty, security, freedom of movement, freedom of religion, assembly and association including political parties and trade unions, due process and equality before the law, protection from arbitrary deprivation of property or deprivation of private property without just compensation, and freedom from racial, ethnic, religious or sexual discrimination. It will prohibit the retroactive application of criminal law. The declaration will be consistent with the provisions of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and other relevant international instruments."

Amnesty International welcomes the commitment on the part of the Royal Government of Cambodia and the National Assembly to adhere to international standards as required both in the terms of the Paris Peace Agreements, and by the SNC's accession to international human rights instruments in 1992. However, Amnesty International is concerned that the Constitution does not provide guarantees of internationally recognised rights to all people subject to its jurisdiction. The wording of the Constitution leaves open the possibility that certain sections of the population may be denied the protection of the human rights provisions in the Constitution to which they should be entitled. This applies particularly to certain articles of Chapter 3 on the rights and duties of Cambodian people. Article 31 states:

"The Kingdom of Cambodia shall recognize and respect human rights as defined in the United Nations Charter, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, and all treaties and conventions concerning human rights, women's rights and children's rights."
“Khmer citizens shall be equal before the law and shall enjoy the same rights, freedom and duties regardless of their race, colour, sex, language, beliefs, religion, political tendencies, birth origin, social status, resources or any other position.”

Ambiguities exist in the wording of this and other articles of the Constitution which could be used by the organs of the state to exclude sectors of the population from full enjoyment of fundamental rights and freedoms. During the years since independence in 1953, certain words in the Cambodian language have been used by different governments and given political overtones, notably by the two communist governments. In particular, several words meaning "people" and "citizens" are no longer used because of their association with former governments. As a consequence, other words have to be found to convey the meaning of the words which are no longer widely used. This allows for considerable ambiguity in interpreting the scope of the human rights guarantees in the new Constitution. Most notably, words which have previously been used by a former non-Communist armed opposition group to mean "Khmer people" have been used extensively in the new Constitution, and officially translated as "Khmer citizens". Thus, under the terms of the Constitution, certain rights and duties afforded to the population are specifically available only to the "Khmer people" or, according to the official translation, to "Khmer citizens". Other words which in the past have always been used to mean "all people" also appear in the official translation to mean "Khmer citizens". For example, an unofficial translation of Article 32 states that "All people have the right to life, personal freedom and security" while the official translation states that only "Every Khmer citizen shall have the right to life, personal freedom and security." Similarly, an unofficial translation of Article 43 states that only "Khmer people of both sexes shall have full right to freedom of belief" while the official translation narrows this further to afford this right only to "Khmer citizens".

Amnesty International is concerned that the use of the words translated as "Khmer citizens" in the text of the Constitution, excludes sections of the population from the full protection of the constitutional provisions. In a debate on the Constitution in the National Assembly, the definition of "Khmer citizens" was discussed by the representatives. It was agreed that the term included some of Cambodia's ethnic minorities, such as the hilltribe people, known as "Khmer Leu" and the Muslim Cham population, the "Khmer Islam". However, according to the reports of the debate, representatives agreed that people of ethnic Vietnamese origin were not included in the definition. One member of the assembly reportedly said "It doesn't include Vietnamese. Vietnamese are foreigners."  

5 The words used in the text are "prachea pulrut khmae" which used to be translated simply as "Khmer people" or more formally as "people of the Khmer nation". However, at other points in the text, the words "Chun krup roup" are used, which was previously translated unambiguously as "all people".

International reminds the Royal Government of Cambodia that under Article 2 of the ICCPR, which they are bound to uphold, all individuals within a country's territory are entitled to protection of internationally recognised human rights, including many provided in the Cambodian Constitution itself only to 'Khmer citizens'. Specifically, Article 2 of the ICCPR states that:

"Each State Party to the present Covenant undertakes to respect and to ensure all individuals within its territory and subject to its jurisdiction the rights recognized in the present Covenant, without distinction of any kind, such as race, colour, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status," and further that 'where not already provided for by existing legislative or other measures, each State Party to the present Covenant undertakes to take the necessary steps, in accordance with its constitutional processes and with the provisions of the present Covenant, to adopt such legislative or other measures as may be necessary to give effect to the rights recognized in the present Covenant.'

The ethnic Vietnamese minority have been subject to discrimination and persecution in Cambodia, particularly in the last 25 years. Many ethnic Vietnamese arrived in Cambodia in the 19th century, and settled in fertile agricultural areas on the banks of the country's rivers, and on the Tonle Sap lake. More followed in the early part of the 20th century, brought in by the French to assist in the administration of the Cambodian protectorate. Following state-sanctioned massacres under General Lon Nol in the early 1970s, and forced expulsion to Viet Nam under the rule of the Khmer Rouge in 1975, the size of the ethnic Vietnamese community was substantially reduced, from an estimated 300,000 in 1970 to as low as 56,000 in 1984. After the Vietnamese invasion in 1979, many ethnic Vietnamese whose families had lived in Cambodia for generations and who were expelled during the Khmer Rouge era returned to Cambodia. They were followed by new migrants from Viet Nam, who found it easy to travel and work in Cambodia. When the Vietnamese army withdrew from the country in September 1989, large numbers of Vietnamese remained, including some who had settled there during the period of Vietnamese military occupation since 1979. Thus the origins of the ethnic Vietnamese community in Cambodia are varied, and while some have arrived since 1979, many others are people whose parents and grandparents were born in Cambodia, and whose families have been in Cambodia for generations, or have returned recently following the forced expulsion during the Khmer Rouge era. Whatever their origin, all people are entitled to protection of their fundamental human rights, and a constitution should reflect this.

7 Refer to Cambodia: Arbitrary killings of ethnic Vietnamese (ASA 23/05/93) for details of recent abuses.

8 Lack of official records on nationality and residence make accurate estimates difficult, and complicate further the legal definition of national status for ethnic Vietnamese in Cambodia. Estimates of the number of ethnic Vietnamese resident in Cambodia today vary from less than 100,000 to more than 500,000.
Traditional antipathy towards Vietnam, combined with the effects of the Vietnamese occupation of Cambodia left the ethnic Vietnamese population vulnerable to racist attacks. During the period of the UNTAC mandate more than 140 ethnic Vietnamese civilians were killed in Cambodia and over 75 injured. UNTAC investigators placed responsibility for the majority of the attacks on Vietnamese people with forces of the PDK. Thousands of ethnic Vietnamese fled to the border with Viet Nam, but were initially denied entry. The then Provisional National Government of Cambodia refused to accept responsibility for their safety, and denied them permission to return. In April 1993, Prince Norodom Sihanouk commented that "Anti-Vietnamese hatred is such that the only reasonable alternative left to them, is to leave Cambodia straight away and go and live in Viet Nam." While most of those ethnic Vietnamese who gathered at the Cambodian border with Viet Nam were eventually allowed access to Viet Nam, or were allowed back to Cambodia, more than 4,000 remain at the border on Cambodian territory, but unable to return to their former homes in the country.

While the PDK forces were responsible for most of the violent attacks on ethnic Vietnamese civilians, anti-Vietnamese propaganda was a feature of the campaigns of many of the political parties which contested the election, including FUNCINPEC, and the Buddhist Liberal Democratic Party, headed by former KPNLF leaders. When Prince Norodom Ranariddh, now first Prime Minister of Cambodia, was interviewed in 1992, he called upon UNTAC to ensure the withdrawal of all foreign forces from Cambodia "meaning every Vietnamese and not just uniformed Vietnamese". In an interview with the Cambodia Times in October 1993, King Norodom Sihanouk, (formerly Prince Norodom Sihanouk, Chairman of the SNC) dismissed speculation that there would be forced repatriation of ethnic Vietnamese from Cambodia, but since then there have been calls for tough new immigration laws. Son Sann, leader of the former KPNLF, and dean of the National Assembly, issued a 15 point manifesto on 25 October, in which he called for the Royal Government of Cambodia to vote for a detailed immigration law in order to protect "national identity".

The Judiciary

The Paris Peace Agreements required that "an independent judiciary will be established, empowered to enforce the rights provided under the constitution". The new Constitution complies with this requirement, under Chapter Nine, which states that "the judiciary shall be
Amnesty International welcomes the commitment to the independence of the judiciary in the new Constitution. However, a statement of intention does not amount to a guarantee of independence, and Amnesty International is concerned that the existing court structure in Cambodia is ill-equipped to take on its new responsibilities. During the period 1975 to 1978, there was no judicial system whatsoever in Cambodia. The current judicial system is based on the Vietnamese court system, and is closely linked with former judicial structures from the SOC era. During the period of the SOC Government, there was no independent judiciary in Cambodia. Detention without trial, unfair trials, incommunicado detention, lack of provision for defence of accused persons and ill-treatment of prisoners were commonplace.12

UNTAC officials drafted the Provisions relating to the Judiciary and Criminal Law and Procedure Applicable in Cambodia During the Transitional Period, but the legal system in place to implement these guidelines has not changed substantively since the period of the SOC Government, and is staffed largely by the same people who were in charge prior to the Paris Peace Agreements. There is an urgent need for a national penal code and criminal procedure code in the Kingdom of Cambodia. According to the United Nations Programme of Human Rights Activities in Cambodia, which lays down the priorities and the mandate of the UN Centre for Human Rights in the post-UNTAC period, at present no legislative framework, regulations, or machinery for the enforcement of the rights enumerated in the 1993 Constitution exist. UNTAC observers found that Cambodian courts fail to conform to the minimum requirements for an independent judiciary. There is also a severe shortage of trained personnel, particularly lawyers and judges, who will be able to ensure that the judiciary becomes truly independent of the executive and legislative powers. If the judicial system in the Kingdom of Cambodia is to meet the standards required of it by the new Constitution, in accordance with the provisions of international human rights instruments, then a comprehensive education and training programme of personnel in the police, prison service and the judiciary is essential.

Amnesty International’s concerns

Amnesty International is concerned that the wording of the new Constitution may discriminate against people who are not Khmer citizens, and in particular against the ethnic Vietnamese. Amnesty International believes that the human rights standards laid down in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and related international instruments should apply to all people, and that in particular, everyone should have the right to life, liberty,

11 A literal translation would read “the power of the courts shall be an independent power”.

12 For details of particular human rights abuses which occurred in the 1980s, see Kampuchea: Political Imprisonment and Torture (ASA/23/05/87).
security, freedom of expression and association, regardless of their ethnic origin, sex, colour, language, religious or political beliefs. Amnesty International reminds the Royal Government of Cambodia that under Article 26 of the ICCPR they are required to ensure that:

"All persons are equal before the law and are entitled without any discrimination to the equal protection of the law. In this respect, the law shall prohibit any discrimination and guarantee to all persons equal and effective protection against discrimination on any ground such as race, colour, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status."

Although the wording of the Cambodian Constitution can be interpreted as affording certain rights to all persons, including the right to life, freedom and personal security, and the right to defend oneself in court, Amnesty International is concerned that the official translation of the Constitution affords most rights only to "Khmer citizens". Guarantees of fundamental rights are given only to the "Khmer people" or "Khmer citizens" which discriminates against sections of the Cambodian population, and thus breaks the obligation of the Royal Government of Cambodia to conform to the standards of the ICCPR.

**Recommendations to the Royal Government of Cambodia**

Amnesty International recommends that the Royal Government of Cambodia and the National Assembly amend the Constitution, in accordance with the recognised procedures, to replace the words "Cambodian people" (which it translates as "Khmer citizens") in the text of the Constitution, with the words "all persons" where these words would ensure that Cambodian constitutional guarantees comply with the ICCPR. Specifically, Amnesty International calls upon the Royal Government of Cambodia to:

- amend Article 31 of the Constitution which states that "Every Khmer citizen shall be equal before the law, enjoying the same rights, freedom and fulfilling the same obligations, regardless of race, colour, sex, language, religious beliefs, political tendency, birth origin, social status, wealth or other status." Article 26 of the ICCPR states that "all persons shall be equal before the law" and the Cambodian Constitution should thus be amended to comply with the standards laid down in the ICCPR.

- amend Article 36 of the Constitution which states that "Khmer citizens of either sex shall have the right to form and be members of a trade union" to guarantee this right to all persons, as stated in Article 22 of the ICCPR.
similarly to amend Article 42 of the Constitution in order to guarantee all people the right to form associations, as called for in Article 22 of the ICCPR.

- amend Article 41 of the Constitution which guarantees the rights to freedom of expression, freedom of the press and publication, and freedom of assembly to Khmer citizens. Article 19 of the ICCPR states that everyone has the right to hold opinions without interference, and to have freedom of expression. Therefore, Amnesty International recommends that the Cambodian Constitution be amended to comply with Article 19 of the ICCPR.

- amend Article 43 of the Constitution, which guarantees the full right of freedom of belief only to "Khmer citizens of either sex", and not to "all persons" as required under Article 18 of the ICCPR which states that "everyone shall have the right to freedom of thought, conscience and religion."

Amnesty International further recommends that, in order to ensure that it is clear that the Constitution of the Kingdom of Cambodia complies with the ICCPR, the official translation of the Constitution is amended. Specifically, Amnesty International recommends that:

- the translation of Article 32 is amended, to read "All persons shall have the right to life, personal freedom and security" as it appears in the Khmer original.

- the translation of Article 38 is amended to read "All persons shall have the right to defend themselves in court" as it appears in the Khmer original.

- the translation of Articles 31, 36, 41, 42 and 43 of the Constitution be amended in accordance with the amendments to the Khmer original.

**Recommendations to the United Nations**

Amnesty International recalls that the signatories to the Paris Peace Agreements undertook obligations under the terms of the Agreements, to "promote and encourage respect for and observance of human rights and fundamental freedoms in Cambodia as embodied in the relevant international instruments in order, in particular, to prevent the recurrence of human rights abuses." To facilitate this the United Nations Commission on Human Rights adopted resolution 1993/6 in February 1993 which allowed for the establishment of a Field Centre of the UN Centre for Human Rights in Cambodia, following the withdrawal of UNTAC personnel at the end of the UNTAC mandate. The resolution called for the Centre to undertake, among other responsibilities, to:
Amnesty International welcomes the establishment in Phnom Penh of a Cambodian Field Centre of the UN Centre for Human Rights, and the programme of activities it has drawn up, notably in the field of training for the judiciary, police and prison personnel, and providing assistance in the elaboration and implementation of national laws involving human rights issues. However, the organization is concerned that the demands upon this Field Centre are too great for its limited resources. In particular, Amnesty International is concerned that uncertainties over funding for the Centre could hinder its ability to function. All activities to be implemented by the Centre must be financed from the new Trust Fund for Human Rights in Cambodia. An appeal for contributions to this fund was launched in November 1993.

Amnesty International calls upon all potential donors, and in particular the governments which are signatories to the Paris Peace Agreements to contribute to the Trust Fund for Human Rights in Cambodia, which will enable the Field Centre to carry out its vital human rights education and training functions. Assistance from the UN to the Royal Government of Cambodia and to the new legislative and judicial institutions is essential if Cambodia is to comply with the international human rights instruments to which it has acceded. The terms of Chapter Nine of the new Constitution may be regarded as a positive starting point for the protection of human rights in Cambodia by the judiciary. However, it is unrealistic to expect that Cambodia's judicial and police structures will be able immediately to perform to the high standards required of them without substantial help from the international community, in the form of training and assistance with human rights monitoring and reporting procedures. The UN Commission on Human Rights Resolution 1993/6 of February 1993 also requested the Secretary-General to appoint a Special Representative for Human Rights in Cambodia. Amnesty International welcomes the appointment of Justice Michael Kirby to this important post.

Amnesty International believes that if the Royal Government of Cambodia and the United Nations act upon the recommendations given above, human rights guarantees for all the population in the Kingdom of Cambodia will be greatly strengthened.