NEW ZEALAND: RIGHTS FOR ALL YET TO BE REALISED

AMNESTY INTERNATIONAL SUBMISSION FOR THE UN UNIVERSAL PERIODIC REVIEW, 32ND SESSION OF THE UPR WORKING GROUP, JANUARY-FEBRUARY 2019
Amnesty International is a global movement of more than 7 million people who campaign for a world where human rights are enjoyed by all.

Our vision is for every person to enjoy all the rights enshrined in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and other international human rights standards.

We are independent of any government, political ideology, economic interest or religion and are funded mainly by our membership and public donations.
CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION
FOLLOW UP TO THE PREVIOUS REVIEW
VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN AND GIRLS
CHILDREN’S RIGHTS
THE NATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS FRAMEWORK
SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS
PARLIAMENTARY PROCESSES
ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS
HUMAN RIGHTS SITUATION ON THE GROUND
ASYLUM-SEEKERS AND REFUGEES
VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN AND GIRLS
EQUALITY AND NON-DISCRIMINATION IN THE CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEM
PLACES OF DETENTION
JUVENILE JUSTICE
RECOMMENDATION FOR ACTION BY THE STATE UNDER REVIEW

NEW ZEALAND: RIGHTS FOR ALL YET TO BE REALISED
AMNESTY INTERNATIONAL SUBMISSION FOR THE UN UNIVERSAL PERIODIC REVIEW —
32ND SESSION OF THE UPR WORKING GROUP, JANUARY-FEBRUARY 2019
PUBLISHED JULY 2018
Amnesty International
INTRODUCTION

This submission was prepared for the Universal Periodic Review (UPR) of New Zealand in January-February 2019. In it, Amnesty International evaluates the implementation of recommendations made to New Zealand in its previous UPR, including in relation to gender-based violence and children’s rights.

With regard to the national human rights framework, Amnesty welcomes improved parliamentary processes to better align domestic legislation with New Zealand’s human rights obligations, but considers that institutional preventative mechanisms are still lacking to prevent the passage of Bills in breach of human rights.

Amnesty International also sets out a number of concerns with regard to the human rights situation on the ground, including the detention of asylum-seekers, continued and alarming rates of gender-based violence, overrepresentation of Māori in the criminal justice system, and breaches of human rights standards in places of detention.

FOLLOW UP TO THE PREVIOUS REVIEW

Amnesty International welcomes New Zealand’s engagement with the Universal Periodic Review (UPR) and its acceptance of 121 of the 155 recommendations made to it by other states during its previous review in 2014.¹

Amnesty International also welcomes that New Zealand accepted a recommendation to develop a new human rights action plan under the auspices of the Human Rights Commission.²

New Zealand has acted on this recommendation by working with the Human Rights Commission, non-government organizations and civil society to develop the National Plan of Action for the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights.³ This Plan also records the actions the government is taking to protect and promote Human Rights as a result of the commitments it made in 2014 UPR process.⁴ Amnesty International believes the free interactive online tool developed under the

² A/HRC/26/3, recommendations 128.42 [Burkina Faso].
Plan has improved the level of transparency and accessibility for New Zealanders to measure levels of progress on UPR recommendations.

**VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN AND GIRLS**

In 2014, New Zealand accepted 22 recommendations from other states in relation to increasing its efforts to combat all forms of violence against women. 5 Amnesty International acknowledges the work programme of the Ministerial Group on Family Violence and Sexual Violence that began in 2015, the reform of domestic violence legislation in 2017, and the establishment of the roles of Chief Victims Advisor in 2015 and Under-Secretary to the Minister Justice for Domestic and Sexual Violence issue in 2017. In early 2018, the new government announced a funding increase for family violence services with nearly half allocated to women’s refuge services. 6 It also announced funding for the establishment of a dedicated body to set a clear direction for the government’s commitment to prevent and reduce family and sexual violence, with a collective strategy designed in partnership with the sector, Indigenous Māori and other stakeholders. 7

Amnesty International considers that these actions have to some extent responded to UPR recommendations in the second cycle and demonstrate government prioritisation. For example, the establishment of a dedicated agent to lead a national strategy provides a positive response to a recommendation to develop a comprehensive national action plan to target gender-based violence in consultation with all relevant actors. 8

However, Amnesty International shares the concerns of the Human Rights Commission that the various work programmes and strategies developed by New Zealand over different review periods have been, and will be, subject to change by successive governments, leading to what appears to be an overall lack of policy coherence which can impact outcomes. 9

**CHILDREN’S RIGHTS**

A range of recommendations were accepted by New Zealand in relation to children’s rights, particularly in the spheres of education, child poverty, child abuse and marginalised children. 10

---

5 A/HRC/26/3, recommendations 128.95 [Ireland], 128.106 [Romania], 128.107 [France], 128.108 [Switzerland], 128.109 [United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland], 128.110 [Chile], 128.111 [Congo], 128.112 [Germany], 128.114 [Italy], 128.115 [Namibia], 128.116 [Greece], 128.117 [Cyprus], 128.118 [Slovakia], 128.119 [Spain], 128.120 [Czech Republic], 128.121 [Australia], 128.122 [Botswana], 128.125 [Republic of Moldova], 128.126 [Iran], 128.127 [Hungary], 128.129 [Italy], 128.130 [Paraguay]

6 Press release made by Hon Carmel Sepuloni, Minister of Social Development, Hon Tracey Martin, Minister of Children, and Jan Logie, Under-Secretary to the Minister of Justice on Domestic and Sexual Violence Issues, 9 May 2018, available at [https://beehive.govt.nz/release/significant-funding-boost-family-violence-services](https://beehive.govt.nz/release/significant-funding-boost-family-violence-services)


8 A/HRC/26/3, recommendation 128.127 [Hungary].


10 A/HRC/26/3, recommendation 128.55 [Ukraine].
Amnesty International welcomes New Zealand’s renewed commitment to reducing child poverty, including the introduction of legislation in 2018 that proposes a framework for measuring and targeting both child poverty and overall wellbeing, and aligns it with rights in the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child.\textsuperscript{11} However, Amnesty International believes that a stronger rights-based approach is required to ensure enduring child-rights focused policy and results across the board, given that well-being is multi-faceted in nature, particularly for marginalised children.\textsuperscript{12}

**THE NATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS FRAMEWORK**

**SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS**

Since the 2014 review New Zealand has endorsed the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, by which achievements in human development will be measured until 2030.

Amnesty International considers that implementation of the SDG Agenda in New Zealand’s policy and legislative framework has considerable potential to drive enhanced human rights outcomes.

**PARLIAMENTARY PROCESSES**

Amnesty International welcomes the improved layers of disclosure and scrutiny in the parliamentary process to facilitate better alignment of legislation with human rights obligations. This includes the binding requirement to publish disclosure statements to accompany the introduction of most government bills, the referral of bills that have been declared inconsistent with the New Zealand Bill of Rights Act (BORA) to a parliamentary select committee for consideration, and potential statutory power for senior courts to make declarations of inconsistency with the BORA, and to require Parliament to respond.\textsuperscript{13}

However, since the 2014 review of New Zealand, approximately 18 bills have progressed despite declared inconsistencies with the BORA and potential breaches of international human rights obligations.\textsuperscript{14} There are no procedures to ensure that the Member of Parliament introducing a bill responds to declarations of inconsistency, and no further update from the Member of Parliament is required before the final reading of the bill. Amnesty International considers that the New


\textsuperscript{12} For example children with disabilities are more likely to live in low-income households. For more information, see [http://www.cpag.org.nz/assets/150317ChildDisability.pdf](http://www.cpag.org.nz/assets/150317ChildDisability.pdf) (accessed 28 May 2018)


Zealand Parliament still lacks institutional preventative mechanisms for removing or redrafting bills in breach of human rights.

ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS

Amnesty International has consistently advocated for the inclusion of economic, social and cultural rights (ESCR) alongside civil and political rights in New Zealand’s Bill of Rights Act. Amnesty International regrets that New Zealand rejected recommendations made by several states to incorporate ESCR into the BORA during the 2014 review. It accepted two broader recommendations relating to continuing its work and reflections towards having a written constitution, and incorporating international human rights instruments in its domestic legal framework.

However, as of June 2018, Amnesty International is concerned that New Zealand’s recorded action in response to these particular recommendations has been to commit to “advancing the Constitutional Review”, of which there is little evidence of substantive progress. In November 2013, a government-appointed Constitutional Advisory Panel, which sought the input of New Zealanders on constitutional arrangements, delivered its report to the government. One recommendation by the Panel was to set up a process, with public consultation and participation, to explore in more detail the options for amending the Bill of Rights Act, to improve its effectiveness, such as adding economic, social and cultural rights, property rights and environmental rights. While the report was presented to and acknowledged by the government in 2013, it is disappointing that as of 2018 there appears to have been no further formal response, other than a statement to the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights in 2017 that “the Government has no plans to review the BORA at this stage.”

16 A/HRC/26/3, recommendations 128.30 [Benin] and 128.31 [Nicaragua].
17 The Government recorded action to address these recommendations under the online reporting framework noted that “the Government has considered the Constitutional Advisory Panel Report and is satisfied that the objective of facilitating public engagement, awareness and discussion on New Zealand constitutional arrangements has been achieved. The Government will take into account the report and its recommendations as work in the constitutional area is progressed in the future but it will not issue a formal response.” Further information available at http://npa.hrc.co.nz/#/action/14 (accessed 25 May 2018)
HUMAN RIGHTS SITUATION ON THE GROUND

ASYLUM-SEEKERS AND REFUGEES

Amnesty International remains concerned about breaches of the rights of persons seeking asylum in New Zealand, including the detention of some asylum-seekers alongside the wider remand detainee population, their security and well-being, and the length of time in detention.

In 2018, a community sponsorship refugee pilot was developed as an additional protection pathway for refugees alongside the government’s resettlement programme. A group of 21 UNHCR refugees arrived under the pilot in 2018 and are being supported in their resettlement by approved community organisations. Amnesty International welcomes the opportunity of community sponsorship to increase New Zealand’s commitment to international responsibility-sharing, to increase protection spaces, and to build community support for refugee rights. However, Amnesty International and other organisations have also expressed concern at the requirement for sponsored refugees under the pilot to meet language, skills, health and age criteria that could be considered discriminatory.

VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN AND GIRLS

As of 2018 it is difficult to paint an accurate and up-to-date picture of gender-based violence in New Zealand, including prevalence of violence and reporting. This is due to a variety of factors, including lack of data, significant under-reporting, and changes to how police collect data. There is, however, general consensus among both government agencies and the non-governmental sector that gender-based violence remains both prevalent and under-reported.

---

20 Community-based sponsorship programs allow individuals to directly engage in refugee resettlement efforts. Sponsors commit to providing financial, emotional and resettlement support to help newly-arrived refugees integrate into life in a new country. Further information available at http://www.refugeesponsorship.org/community-sponsorship (accessed 28 June 2018)


23 The government continues to recognize that New Zealand has amongst the highest reported rates of family violence and sexual violence in the developed world. The Ministry of Justice also reports that The New Zealand Crime and Safety Survey, carried out in 2005 and 2008 estimate that between 7% and 9% of sexual offences are reported to Police. Statistics for 2013 are not available. Further information available at https://www.justice.govt.nz/justice-sector-policy/research-data/nzcas/survey-results/results-by-subject/sexual-violence/ (accessed 25 May 2018). Rape Crisis, a national agency that provides support and advocacy to survivors of sexual violence also identify that sexual violence is both hidden and prevalent in New Zealand. Further information available at http://rpe.co.nz/information/statistics/ (accessed 28 June 2018)
Between 2009 and 2015, there were 92 intimate partner violence deaths. In 98% of these deaths where there was a recorded history of abuse, women were the primary victim, abused by their male partner.24

Amnesty International is also deeply concerned that gender-based violence, including sexual harassment, is violating the human rights of women in multiple spheres of their life and influence, including in online spaces. In 2017, research commissioned by Amnesty International found that around 1/3 of the women surveyed said they had experienced online abuse and harassment. Of those women, 49% feared for their physical safety, 32% feared for the physical safety of their families as a result, and 49% said they used social media less, or had stopped altogether.25

EQUALITY AND NON-DISCRIMINATION IN THE CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEM

Amnesty International has consistently raised the disproportionate rates of Māori representation in the criminal justice system in New Zealand in its annual reports on the state of the world’s human rights.26 In the last review, New Zealand accepted four recommendations relating specifically to preventing and addressing structural discrimination and to the over-representation of Māori in the criminal justice system, including high incarceration rates of Māori.27 A further eleven recommendations related more broadly to equality and non-discrimination for Māori and Pacific Peoples.28

These recommendations contribute to the range of recommendations that have been made repeatedly to New Zealand by UN treaty bodies, special procedures and other states expressing concern about the systematic bias against and over-representation of Māori, particularly women and youth, in the criminal justice system.29

Amnesty International acknowledges implementation of initiatives such as the Turning of the Tide Strategy in 2012, which was co-designed by the police and Indigenous Māori tribes and sought to take a preventative approach to address the over-representation of Māori, including through a holistic approach to preventing crime in communities and supporting families at risk. It set targets such as a 10% decrease in the proportion of Māori first-time youth and adult offenders by 2018.


27 A/HRC/26/3, recommendations 128.81 [Ireland], 128.82 [Cabo Verde], 128.84 [Thailand], 128.133 [Iran].

28 A/HRC/26/3, recommendations 128.64 [China], 128.68 [Gabon], 128.71 [Jamacia], 128.82 [Canada] and 128.73 [State of Palestine], 128.74 [United States of America], 128.75 [Switzerland], 128.76 [United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland], 128.77 [Czech Republic], 128.78 [Djibouti], 128.79 [Greece].

In 2016, the Police, Corrections and Justice Departments also set a target to reduce Māori re-offending by 25% by 2025.

However despite these strategies and targets, Amnesty International is concerned that very little progress has been made since the last review. In 2018 Māori remain alarmingly over-represented at all stages of the criminal justice system, including apprehension, remand, conviction, imprisonment and re-imprisonment.30

The over-representation of Māori is particularly stark in the youth justice system: in 2017, Māori comprised around 64% of all youth charged, with more youth in court than all other ethnicities.31 While the number of youth charged in all the other ethnic groups has continued to decrease, the number of Māori youth charged in 2017 remains similar to the number in 2014.32

Amnesty International notes that while the government has traditionally responded to recommendations by highlighting cultural responsiveness programmes and strategies, it remains reluctant to publicly acknowledge any structural discrimination against Māori.33

**PLACES OF DETENTION**

Despite 2016 marking the tenth anniversary of New Zealand’s ratification of the Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, Amnesty International is concerned that a number of serious issues have been reported in detention facilities since the last review of New Zealand.34 A 2016 independent report found a high use of seclusion and restraint in various forms, including solitary confinement, across correction and health facilities. The data gathered by the report showed that ethnic minority groups, in particular Māori, were over-represented in seclusion and segregation units.35

In 2017, the Ombudsman found that the use of tie-down bed and/or waist restraints on five prisoners amounted to cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment, as set out in Article 16 of the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment.36

---

30 In 2017, the Ministry of Justice identified that the number of Māori adults convicted in the past year had increased, while the number of European and Pacific adults convicted has continued to drop. Māori represent 45% of all arrests and 38% of all convictions. In April 2017 the Waitangi Tribunal released its report Tū Mai te Rangi! Report on the Crown and Disproportionate Reoffending Rates. It found that Corrections had breached the Treaty of Waitangi (between Indigenous Māori and the Crown) principles of active protection and equity by not sufficiently prioritising the reduction of Māori re-offending rates.


32 Ministry of Justice Youth Prosecution Statistics: Data highlights for 2017, as above.

33 Kim Workman “From a Search for Rangatiratanga to a Struggle for Survival – Criminal Justice, the State and Māori, 1985 to 2015”, Journal of New Zealand Studies NS22 (2016), 89-104 p. 98.

34 A/HRC/26/3, recommendations 128.27 [Indonesia], 128.32 [Togo], 128.33 [Ukraine], 128.34 [Uruguay], 128.35 [Spain].


Amnesty International also considers that the dramatic increase in New Zealand’s prison population, particularly the remand population, since the last review, poses risks relating to conditions and treatment in places of detention, including the use of double bunking.  

**JUVENILE JUSTICE**

Amnesty International welcomes that since the last review, New Zealand has raised the age that a juvenile is tried within the adult criminal justice system to 18 in order to include 17 year olds in its alternative youth justice system.

However, Amnesty International is deeply concerned at the significant increase since the last review in the number of juveniles held in police cells for more than 24 hours. Official figures released to Amnesty International show that the number of placements of juveniles in police cells for more than 24 hours increased from 62 to 284 placements between 2014 and 2017. The average period of stay in police custody has also increased in this period, from 1.8 days to 2.3.

Amnesty International considers that the continued and increased detention of juveniles in adult detention facilities, such as police cells, has the potential to breach international human rights standards.

New Zealand also retains its reservation to the Convention on the Rights of the Child regarding mixing of juveniles with adults in places of detention.  

---


38 Oranga Tamariki – Ministry for Children For the period 31 March 2014 to 31 March 2018, the number of children and young people detained in Police cells for more than 24 hours, by average duration in police custody, broken down by region. (1 July 2018).

39 Including under the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, and the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment.

40 The Government of New Zealand reserves the right not to apply article 37 (c) in circumstances where the shortage of suitable facilities makes the mixing of juveniles and adults unavoidable; and further reserves the right not to apply article 37 (c) where the interests of other juveniles in an establishment require the removal of a particular juvenile offender or where mixing is considered to be of benefit to the persons concerned.
RECOMMENDATION FOR ACTION BY THE STATE UNDER REVIEW

AMNESTY INTERNATIONAL CALLS ON THE GOVERNMENT OF NEW ZEALAND TO:

UPR FOLLOW-UP

- In partnership with civil society and the Human Rights Commission, develop a new National Plan of Action for the Protection and Promotion of Human Rights and ensure that it is both adequately resourced and transparently reported on, including via an accessible online tool;
- Continue to develop a monitoring framework for the realisation of the Sustainable Development Goals in the domestic context.

PARLIAMENTARY PROCESSES

- Put explicit requirements in place to ensure transparent consistency of all policy and legislation with human rights obligations;
- Establish a parliamentary human rights committee to analyse primary and secondary legislation to ensure consistency with human rights obligations, and to publicly report its findings;
- Ensure that Members of Parliament submitting a bill respond publicly to reports that its provisions are inconsistent with the Bill of Rights Act 1990;
- Table all concluding observations and recommendations from UN Treaty Bodies and Special Procedures in Parliament for debate.

ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS

- Incorporate economic, social and cultural rights into the Bill of Rights Act 1990;
- Present a full report on the government’s response to the Constitutional Advisory Panel and establish next steps to implementing its recommendations.

ASYLUM-SEEKERS AND REFUGEES

- Ensure that asylum-seekers who are detained are separated from the general prison population and only detained in strict accordance with New Zealand’s international human rights obligations;
- Ensure that asylum-seekers have the right to regular review of their detention and have adequate access to lawyers, their families, health providers and support groups;
- Approve the Community Sponsorship category as an ongoing programme that meets all requirements of the UN Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees, including the Article 3 principle of non-discrimination;
- Expand the number of refugees accepted under the Community Sponsorship category to be consistent with the principles of international responsibility-sharing.

VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN AND GIRLS

- Develop a cross-party strategy on family and sexual violence to be adhered to by all
political parties and implemented by successive governments;

- Ensure that the new body charged with transforming the family and sexual violence system sets targets and timelines to monitor and report on progress in reducing all forms of violence against women and girls, in line with SDG Target 16.1 and associated indicators;

- Develop a comprehensive system of recording and analysing data on violence, disaggregated by relationship of the perpetrator to the victim, race, gender, disability, sexual orientation, and age;

- Amend the legislative framework to ensure that it adequately protects and provides adequate remedies for victims of gender-based violence in all spheres of life, including in the workplace and in online platforms, in line with SDG Targets 5.1, 10.3 and 16.1.

EQUALITY AND NON-DISCRIMINATION IN THE CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEM

- Identify and eliminate all forms of structural discrimination against Māori, in line with SDG Target 10.3 and report in line with its indicators;

- Set further targets and strategy to reduce Māori over-representation at all levels of the criminal justice system and ensure that the strategies are co-designed by Māori communities and adequately resourced.

PLACES OF DETENTION

- Ensure that seclusion, isolation and use of restraints is consistent with international human rights law and does not breach the absolute prohibition on torture and other forms of cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment;

- Prohibit in law and practice the solitary confinement and seclusion of juveniles, persons with intellectual or psychosocial disabilities, pregnant women, women with infants and breastfeeding mothers, in prison and in other institutions, both public and private;

- Assess the impact of the growth of the prison population, particularly the remand population, on the human rights of people in detention, in line with SDG Indicator 16.3.2.

CHILDREN’S RIGHTS

- Implement the recommendations of the Children’s Convention Monitoring Group in full, in particular to develop systems and processes to ensure that legislation incorporates, and is consistent with, the principles and provisions of the Convention on the Rights of the Child;

- Develop a national strategy that implements the Convention on the Rights of the Child for all children;

- Remove reservations to the Convention on the Rights of the Child;

- Abolish the option in legislation to detain juveniles in police cells with other adults and ensure that the practice is eradicated;

- Ensure that there are adequate youth facilities and community-based alternatives to prison or police custody for juvenile offenders on remand.
AMNESTY INTERNATIONAL IS A GLOBAL MOVEMENT FOR HUMAN RIGHTS. WHEN INJUSTICE HAPPENS TO ONE PERSON, IT MATTERS TO US ALL.

CONTACT US

advocacy@amnesty.org.nz
0800 AMNESTY

JOIN THE CONVERSATION

www.facebook.com/AmnestyNZ
@AmnestyNZ