

EXTERNAL (for general distribution)

AI Index: ACT 33/36/93

Distr: SC/PG

---

Amnesty International  
International Secretariat  
1 Easton Street  
London WC1X 8DJ  
United Kingdom

October 1993

## **@Political killings and disappearances: medicolegal aspects**

### **Background**

In many countries around the world, real or suspected political opponents of the government disappear following abduction or are killed by agents acting for the government or with its knowledge and tacit approval. The same fate is inflicted on people who are seen as socially undesirable - for example, petty criminals, street children or homeless people. Armed opposition groups in some countries are also now using disappearance and targeted killings as a means of disposing of opponents. These are major forms of human rights abuse.

Disappearance as a systematic technique of mass repression is a comparatively recent phenomenon (though individual and small scale disappearances may have happened in earlier epochs). It was used during the period of Nazi occupation in Europe. In 1941, some 7000 people from German-occupied territories, particularly France, who were identified as opponents of the Nazis were abducted and secretly transferred to concentration camps in Germany. The order setting this in motion was known as the "Night and Fog" Decree. Disappearance was deliberately used to sow fear and disorientation in the affected populations, which were deprived of information about the fate of loved ones. In the words of the chief of the German High Command, "These measures will have a deterrent effect because (a) the prisoners will vanish without leaving a trace, (b) no information may be given as to their whereabouts or their fate".

From the mid-1960s, disappearance as a tool of political repression was employed by security forces in Guatemala. It was from Guatemala that the term *desaparecido* (disappeared one) originated in the 1960s. In the 1970s, disappearances occurred in significant numbers in Argentina, Chile, Philippines and Uganda amongst other places<sup>2</sup>. Currently, Amnesty International is concerned about disappearances as a human rights violation in more than 25 countries. In 1992, Amnesty International learned of nearly 1000 individuals who had disappeared after arrest by security forces. Thousands more remain unaccounted for from earlier years.

In contrast to disappearances, political killings are a very old phenomenon with individual cases occurring in at least 45 states during 1992.

---

<sup>1</sup> Cited in: Amnesty International. *"Disappearances": A Workbook*. New York: AIUSA, 1981, p.2.

<sup>2</sup> *Ibid.*

As a result of the upsurge of disappearances in the 1970s, the United Nations established in 1980 a Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances that could receive information and contact governments about individual cases. Its work is described in chapter 6 of the forthcoming Amnesty International handbook, *"Disappearances" and Political Killings: Human Rights Crisis of the 1990s. A Manual for Action*.<sup>3</sup>

## Investigating the abuses

### ***The role of medico-legal skills in uncovering and exposing human rights violations***

In some cases of disappearance, individuals return alive after days, weeks or even months of secret detention. In many cases, the disappeared people are never seen alive again and it must be presumed that they have either died in secret detention or been killed. In other cases, the remains of disappeared individuals are found, though not necessarily with adequate forms of identification to allow the name and background of the individual to be determined. In many cases, however, victims of disappearance and political killings can be identified and the cause and circumstances of their deaths determined.

---

<sup>3</sup> AI has undertaken a number of initiatives against political killings and disappearances since the first major meeting the organization held on the subject. In 1980 Amnesty International USA convened an international seminar on disappearances with participation by international lawyers, members of human rights organizations and human rights activists from countries where disappearances occurred. The seminar resulted in a workbook on the theme that included cases studies and chapters on the psychological effects and remedies. An international campaign in 1981-82 followed.

In 1982 the Dutch section of AI hosted an international conference on political killings. In 1983 AI held an international campaign against political killings by governments. The report published at the time of the campaign contained case studies as well as general analysis.

In 1983 Amnesty International conducted a mission in El Salvador which included a forensic pathologist. The mission delegates reviewed the procedures for investigation of extrajudicial executions including application of forensic techniques. An international campaign against political killings in El Salvador followed.

In 1992 the Dutch section of AI hosted another international conference on the theme of disappearances and political killings. The meeting discussed various options for campaigning against these abuses and related issues such as bringing perpetrators to justice and action against abuses by opposition groups. It contributed to the design of the 1993/4 international AI campaign against these abuses.

Apart from these specific initiatives, Amnesty International and its worldwide membership has campaigned against political killings and disappearances throughout the three decades of the organization's existence.

## Forensic pathology

The forensic pathologist has an important role to play in determining the cause and manner of death and in elucidating any evidence relevant to the uncovering of a crime. A common reason given by governments or military authorities to explain the death of a victim is that he or she was caught in cross-fire - an accidental victim of shooting between the army and guerillas. Alternatively, they may claim that the victim died during a shoot-out or during an escape attempt. By examining the body and documenting all injuries, including bullet entry and exit wounds, and by visiting the site of the killing if possible, the pathologist may be able to determine the cause and manner of death and to assess the competing stories as to their compatibility with the physical evidence. In many cases known to Amnesty International, the victim was shot in a manner suggesting execution: at short range (less than 50 cm); while lying down; by a single shot to the back of the head. In some cases, hands and arms bear wounds suggesting they were held up in front of the body in an attempt at self defence.

Pathologists can also identify marks on a body indicative of ill-treatment as well as assessing any alternative cause of death, including natural death or suicide, suggested by the government. They can call for additional tests, which sometimes elucidate the cause of death where poison is involved. Moreover, they can extract bullets for examination by ballistics experts, who can identify the types of firearms used and, in some circumstances, identify the weapon from which the bullet was fired<sup>4</sup>.

## Forensic anthropology

In February 1984, following the return to civilian rule in Argentina, human rights activists in that country and the National Commission on the Disappeared (CONADEP), established by President Raúl Alfonsín, approached the American Association for the Advancement of Science (AAAS) for help in establishing the best way of exhuming and identifying the remains of those who had disappeared during the years of military government. Early attempts by Argentinian investigators in 1983 had resulted in the virtual destruction of evidence from opened graves due to the lack of investigational skills of those carrying out the exhumations. In June 1984 US forensic specialists held seminars in La Plata, Cordoba and Buenos Aires. One member of the scientific team was Dr Clyde C. Snow, a renowned US forensic anthropologist, who supervised some on-site investigations and training of local professionals. As a result of their work with Dr Snow, a number of young doctors, anthropologists and students formed the Argentinian Forensic Anthropology Team (EAAF). This team has since conducted or assisted in investigations, or has helped in training local specialists in other countries in Latin America and abroad<sup>5</sup>. The framework for these investigations is always the same: to locate likely burial sites and possible victims; to conduct the exhumation in a scientific and methodical fashion; to examine the remains to determine the cause and manner of death; and to attempt to establish the identity of the victim. A UN document sets out three reasons why forensic scientists investigate graves of victims of political killings.

---

<sup>4</sup> It was the failure of the authorities to carry out adequate ballistics investigations that was a major criticism made by Amnesty International of the government response to a large-scale killing of prisoners in a São Paulo prison in 1992. See *Brazil: Death has arrived: Massacre at the Casa de Detenção, S\_o Paulo*, (AMR 19/08/93).

<sup>5</sup> An account of the work of Snow and forensic anthropologists in Argentina is given by Joyce C and Stover E. *Witnesses from the Grave*. London: Bloomsbury, 1991, 333pp. An account of the EAAF's work also appears in Cohen Salama M. *Tumbas anónimos*. Buenos Aires: Ed Catálogos, 1992

First, from a humanitarian perspective, they hope to be able to inform the families of the deceased of the fate of their loved ones. Second, from a legal standpoint, they aim to uncover legally admissible evidence that will result in the conviction of those responsible for any crimes. Third, they hope to deter future violations by creating awareness, through forensic documentation and subsequent litigation, that those responsible will be held accountable for their actions.<sup>6</sup>

The skills developed in Argentina have been applied elsewhere. In Bolivia, Brazil, Chile, Guatemala, Philippines, Venezuela and Iraqi Kurdistan, careful examination of burial sites has yielded information about the identities of individuals believed to have been killed for political reasons or disappeared up to 15 years before<sup>7</sup>.

However, investigations are frequently obstructed if not neglected or prohibited entirely. For example, in Venezuela more than 200 cases of unclarified deaths and serious injury reported following serious civil disturbance in 1989 are still unresolved in the courts. Most of the remains of 68 victims of killings, which were exhumed during 1990 and 1991 from a mass grave in the cemetery of "La Peste", Caracas, have remained unidentified despite the availability of competent forensic specialists. Nobody has been sentenced in connection with the 1989 killings<sup>8</sup>.

In Peru, an attempt by an Amnesty International delegation to have a burial site investigated with the assistance of expert forensic anthropologists was rejected by the authorities, and a crude exhumation of the graves was undertaken in a manner likely to destroy much important evidence<sup>9</sup>.

### ***Development of the UN Manual on the Effective Prevention and Investigation of Extra-Legal, Arbitrary and Summary Executions and other UN initiatives***

In 1984, the Minnesota International Lawyers Committee for Human Rights, stimulated by initiatives undertaken by forensic specialists and by the evident lack of international standards, sponsored the drafting of an investigation protocol for the examination of the remains of individuals who appear to be the victims of extrajudicial execution. Over subsequent years, several drafts of the "Minnesota Protocol" were circulated internationally to relevant professional and human rights specialists for comment. In 1987, a meeting was convened in Minnesota to discuss the Protocol as well as principles for investigation of possible politically motivated killings. The recommendations from this meeting were submitted to the UN Committee on Crime Prevention and Control in Vienna for consideration. In August 1988 the UN Committee announced its own draft "Principles on the Effective Prevention and Investigation of Extra-Legal, Arbitrary and Summary Executions," and these were adopted by the UN Economic and Social Council as resolution 65/1989 in May 1989. The protocol and the resolution were published in 1991 as the *Manual for the Prevention and*

<sup>6</sup> UN Economic and Social Council. Report of the Secretary-General on human rights and forensic science submitted pursuant to Commission on Human Rights resolution 1992/24. Document E/CN.4/1993/20, 5 February 1993, p.6.

<sup>7</sup> For reports of these and other forensic investigations see the selected bibliography at appendix 2.

<sup>8</sup> *Venezuela. Arbitrary killings in February/March 1989: victims exhumed from mass graves.* AI Index: AMR 53/02/91, 1991.

<sup>9</sup> *Peru: Public Ministry rejects assistance of forensic experts in death investigation.* AI Index: AMR 46/27/93, 22 July 1993.

***Detection of Extra-Legal, Arbitrary and Summary Executions.*** The purpose of the Manual is to give technical guidance on investigational procedures. It includes detailed sections on autopsy procedures and examination of skeletal remains with recommendations as to which procedures must be regarded as obligatory steps in death investigations.

The United Nations, through the Commission of Human Rights, has continued to promote the use of forensic skills in the investigation of human rights violations. The UN Security Council has also drawn on forensic expertise to investigate allegations of mass killings. In Croatia, many mass graves are believed to exist in the area of Vukovar and it is feared that many of those who disappeared from the Vukovar hospital in 1991 – including civilians, wounded soldiers and surrendered combatants – may have been killed and buried in these graves. A forensic medical team, under the aegis of the UN Commission of Experts, visited the Vukovar area in December 1992 and confirmed the existence of mass grave sites<sup>10</sup>. A thorough exhumation is planned over the coming months.

### **Other inter-governmental initiatives**

At a regional level there have also been positive developments. The Council of Europe's Legal Affairs Committee, after taking evidence from Interpol, the Sevilla Working Party on the Harmonization and Standardization of Forensic Medicine within the European Community, and Amnesty International, resolved in 1990 to press for the harmonisation of autopsy standards within the member countries of the Council. While strong professional arguments were presented in favour of this move – for example, the need to ensure standard identification procedures for victims of air crashes – the prevention and documentation of human rights violations were also accepted as an important reasons for such a move<sup>11</sup>.

### ***Tracing disappeared children***

In Argentina, where thousands of people disappeared during the period of military rule (1976-1983), attempts to find the disappeared started during the first wave of disappearances. Mothers and grandmothers of disappeared young people and infants - some born during the captivity of the mother - commenced demonstrating for the return of their loved ones. With time and with the assistance of the American Association for the Advancement of Science (AAAS), they succeeded in introducing scientific techniques into the search. In particular, they encouraged the application of genetic techniques to identify young children, some of whom had been adopted, usually by military personnel or associates, following the killing of the mothers. By applying analytical techniques to tissues of the surviving family - siblings, uncles and aunts and grandparents - it is possible to arrive at a base of genetic information to compare the markers present in the putative disappeared child. In this way, a small number of children have been identified as offspring of disappeared parents, thus

---

<sup>10</sup> See UN Document S/25274, 10 February 1993. Letter dated 9 February 1993 from the Secretary-General addressed to the President of the Security Council [plus annexes].

<sup>11</sup> Council of Europe Parliamentary Assembly, Doc.6332: Report on the harmonisation of autopsy rules. 31 October 1990. 1403-12/10/90-5-E.

offering the possibility of restitution of the children to their rightful families<sup>12</sup>. Elsewhere, the problem of restitution of children of disappeared mothers to their rightful families has either not been an issue or has not been addressed.

## **The after-effects of abuses**

### ***The effects of disappearances and political killings on survivors and families***

The stresses and suffering inflicted on former disappeared prisoners and the relatives of the disappeared or those killed for political reasons are different in kind, though ultimately the psychological effects may be similar. Those disappeared who subsequently reappear have usually been subjected to torture, privation, extreme isolation and the threat of imminent death. The majority have had to suffer the agony, not only of having no control over their fate, but of having to live in the knowledge that, as they are outside the judicial system, they have no means of knowing how long they will be held - weeks, months or years - or whether they will live or die.

Where prisoners are held for a long time, they may develop disorders typical of prolonged periods without exercise, proper nutrition, or adequate hygiene, including skin, visual, dental and musculo-skeletal problems. On the night of 7/8 August 1973, 58 military prisoners held in Kenitra Central Prison, Morocco, were secretly transferred to the detention centre at Tazmamert in the south of the country, where they were held in appalling conditions without acknowledgement of their existence for 18 years. News of their plight was first smuggled out of the prison in 1980. The surviving prisoners from Tazmamert were released in 1991; they had watched 33 of their fellow prisoners die of disease and malnutrition while being totally deprived of medical care or assistance<sup>13</sup>. When eventually seen by doctors they were reported to suffer a range of physical and psychological problems<sup>14</sup>. Over 300 disappeared people in all were released after an Amnesty International campaign in 1991, but most appear to have received no care. Others remain disappeared and, although their whereabouts or fate are unknown, it is possible that some may still be alive and held in similar secret detention centres.

In such circumstances, former disappeared persons need social support and recognition of the extremely stressful form of abuse they have experienced. They also require careful medical assessment and, where appropriate, medical treatment, as well as measures to address the psychological impact of their experiences. In some cases men or women reappearing after a period of disappearance will manifest symptoms of the type, severity and duration of post-traumatic stress syndrome<sup>15</sup>. Approaches to treatment for severe trauma following torture or other major stresses

---

<sup>12</sup> Di Lonardo A et al. Human genetics and human rights. Identifying the families of kidnapped children. *American Journal of Forensic Medicine and Pathology*, 1984; 5:339-47.

<sup>13</sup> See *Morocco. Tazmamert: Official silence and impunity*. AI Index: MDE 29/07/92, November 1992.

<sup>14</sup> Findings of a mission to Morocco by a delegation from the Johannes Wier Foundation, Netherlands, April/May 1993.

<sup>15</sup> McNally R. Psychopathology of post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD): boundaries of the syndrome. In: Basoglu M (ed). *Torture and Its Consequences*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992, pp.229-52. For a discussion of PTSD in relation to traumatic experiences, see Mollica R, Caspi-Yavin Y. Overview: the assessment and diagnosis of torture events and symptoms. In Basoglu M, *ibid*. pp.253-74.

include psychodynamic psychotherapy, family therapy, group therapy, pharmacotherapy, and behavioral and cognitive therapies<sup>16</sup>.

The experience of the relatives of the disappeared is one of stressful uncertainty. The absence of news of the loved one allows the worst fears to be considered, particularly where there is a known pattern of brutal and lethal ill-treatment of those who are abducted. The families of the disappeared therefore are subject to high levels of stress and anxiety. Where there is an expectation that the disappeared person has been killed, the family is unable to grieve because of the lack of evidence of the death. In fact, even to consider that the disappeared person could be dead can induce strong feelings of guilt. Kordon and Edelman give the case of a 60-year-old Argentinian woman whose son and daughter-in-law were missing. During a first consultation with a psychotherapist, she was advised to consider her son as dead.

She immediately abandons this treatment and shows an intense hostility against the therapist. A second treatment makes evident that, for her, accepting this [advice] is equivalent to the fantasy of her being the murderer of her son.<sup>17</sup>

Relatives of those who have been deliberately targeted and killed by government agents are likely to suffer profound grief mixed with fear, anger and anxiety. They will benefit from the activities of support groups as well as from the availability of legal advice and advocacy. In this context, the role of human rights groups can be of great importance.

### ***Help and self-help***

In some cases, individuals affected by the loss of loved ones as a result of disappearance or political killings have taken action individually or collectively to demand justice and to put an end to the abuses. In Sri Lanka, the Mothers' Front was established in the south in 1989 by women seeking the return of, or an accounting for, disappeared men and for justice for the relatives. One such man was 31-year-old journalist Richard de Soyza, who was abducted in February 1990 by six uniformed armed men. His body was found two days later on a beach. His mother, Dr Manorani Saravanamuttu, a general practitioner, undertook a campaign for the proper investigation of his death and for the prosecution of those responsible. She later was asked to lead the Mothers' Front<sup>18</sup>.

In Argentina, female relatives of those who disappeared after the military coup of 1976 formed the campaigning organizations, the Mothers (Madres) and Grandmothers (Abuelas) of the Plaza de Mayo. The Mothers and Grandmothers, named after the square in central Buenos Aires where they

---

<sup>16</sup> See Basoglu M (ed) *Torture and Its Consequences*.

<sup>17</sup> Kordon DR, Edelman LI. Observations on the psychopathological effects of social silencing concerning the existence of missing people [the disappeared]. In: Kordon DR, Edelman LI et al. *Psychological Effects of Political Repression*. Buenos Aires: Authors, 1988.

<sup>18</sup> Dr Saravanamuttu named a police officer whom she said was one of those responsible for her son's death. After the case against several officers, including the named man, was dropped, he sued her for defamation. On 1 May 1993, he died in the bomb attack which caused the death of President Premasada and the case was dropped. However, a second officer has sued Dr Saravanamuttu for defamation, and this case is continuing.

demonstrated for the return of their loved ones, persistently and courageously pressed successive Argentinian governments to account for their missing family members.

In Guatemala, a *Grupo de Apoyo Mutuo por el Aparecimiento con Vida de Nuestros Familiares* (GAM: Mutual Support Group for the Appearance of our Relatives Alive) was established in 1984 by families of victims of disappearance and political killings to campaign and bring help to those suffering as a result of these human rights violations. In 1990 it was informed that there were more than 100 clandestine cemeteries in Guatemala, though efforts to investigate these have been inadequate and hampered by government obstruction<sup>19</sup>. Several leaders and members of GAM have been killed by death squads since it was established. There is a real need for international support for such groups and increased effort to support those for whom the dangers are too great to organize such self-help organizations.

In some countries, mental health professionals have worked with victims of torture and the relatives of the disappeared or murdered to enable them to re-establish themselves, to press for justice and to pass through the stage of bereavement, or to cope with permanent uncertainty about the fate of their loved one(s). The Psychological Assistance Team of the Mothers of the Plaza de Mayo was established in Buenos Aires, Argentina, shortly after the 1976 coup to provide counselling and therapy to those who wished to receive professional support<sup>20</sup>. There are currently teams of doctors and mental health workers in more than 30 countries offering assistance to victims of torture and other state-organized violence such as disappearances and political killings. Some of these continue to deal with the aftermath of abuses such as disappearances which occurred in the 1970s and 1980s.

## Disappearance and killing of health personnel

Health personnel are sometimes victims of political killings or disappearance. This stems from their role as community leaders and human rights advocates, from their activities in the political arena, and from the role they play (or are perceived to play) professionally in situations of conflict<sup>21</sup>. The case of Dr Luthuli, South Africa (see Table 2 below), illustrates that a mere rumour that a doctor has carried out autopsies can put him or her at risk of reprisals from those responsible for killings. Table 2 below also summarises the cases of health professionals from four other countries who have died or disappeared since 1990 as a result of actions carried out by, on behalf of, or with the knowledge of, governments. This is only an illustrative sample of the total number of such cases.

Amnesty International's campaign against disappearances and political killings is focusing on 24 cases summarized in the attached appendix (table 1). The organization is urging that the governments concerned account for the deaths or disappearance of those listed.

## Response of the medical profession

<sup>19</sup> Americas Watch, Physicians for Human Rights. *Guatemala: Getting Away with Murder*.

<sup>20</sup> Kordon DL, Edelman LI et al. *Psychological Effects of Political Repression*. Buenos Aires: Authors, 1988.

<sup>21</sup> *Health personnel: victims of human rights violations*. AI Index: ACT 75/01/91, 1991.



Disappearances and political killings continue around the world on a shocking scale. Governments are responsible for ending such abuses. They are also responsible for adequate investigation of killings and disappearances, including through the application of medicolegal techniques. At the present time, the standard of forensic medicine varies widely between countries and even within countries. In some countries the investigation of crimes is carried out with the assistance of medicolegal institutes which are responsible to the police or security ministries. In others, forensic practitioners have varying degrees of independence. This suggests that there needs to be a major effort to improve the capacity of forensic services to act without implicit or explicit interference from governments, to improve the standards of forensic science internationally and to improve investigation procedures. The UN Manual will be a helpful resource in this regard though financial and technical questions will still need to be resolved.

Above all, there needs to be concerted pressure on governments to observe their human rights obligations and strong messages of support for those medical professionals continuing to document abuses in an objective and ethical manner. One such practitioner was the late Dr Jonathan Gluckman, whose post-mortem examinations of the bodies of young men who died in custody in South Africa provided powerful evidence of torture and homicide carried out by police officers. His public disclosure of his findings in scores of cases of death in detention proved highly embarrassing to the South African authorities which felt compelled to open investigations into his findings.

Some medical human rights organizations have been active in investigating patterns of abuse and their documentation<sup>22</sup>. Professional associations in affected countries have also protested about abuses where they have affected their members or the delivery of health care, though in some cases it was either too dangerous for any effective protest to be made or the association was under the control of the government and therefore unlikely to protest. In April 1992, the Turkish Medical Association reported on the situation facing doctors in the southeast of the country where there have been a number of killings of health personnel as well as harassment of doctors by government forces and the armed opposition. The TMA delegation urged that "all direct and indirect pressure with regard to forensic reports must be prevented. The interference of prosecutors and members of security forces in autopsies ... should cease. All interference in hospital procedures and the use of hospitals for purposes other than treating patients should be prevented"<sup>23</sup>.

Amnesty International is urging national and international medical bodies to play an active role in calling on governments to respect and protect the impartial and neutral practice of medicine, and to protect the public from political killings and disappearance. The organization also urges the international medical community to work for the better application of the forensic sciences to the investigation of such abuses.

---

<sup>22</sup> See, for example, reports from Physicians for Human Rights listed in the selected bibliography attached to this paper. The American Association for the Advancement of Science (AAAS) has played an active role in promoting training of forensic investigators for the past ten years in Argentina, the Philippines, Costa Rica and Guatemala, and has initiated a teaching scheme which allows a small number of doctors from the countries with human rights problems to train with forensic practitioners in the USA. The Argentinian Team of Forensic Anthropology has also carried out training in Chile, Uruguay, Bolivia, Colombia and El Salvador.

<sup>23</sup> For further information, see *Turkey: Human rights and the medical profession in the southeast*, AI Index: EUR 44/17/93, 2 April 1993



**TABLE 1: CAMPAIGN CASES** (summary background information on 24 cases highlighted in the AI campaign)

Country	Name	Profession	Last seen alive	Details
Bosnia-Herzegovina	"Mirsada" [pseudonym]	Teenager	June 1992 Disappeared	Serbian paramilitaries took Mirsada, 16, her sister Azra, 17, and one of their school friends from a flat. The girls were told that they were going to be taken to the police station but instead were taken to a hotel where they were interrogated, beaten and raped. Azra, who heard Mirsada crying in the hall, was eventually released, but Mirsada has not been seen since; police say they can do nothing.
Brazil	Roberto Carlos da Costa	Teenager	10 September 1992. Disappeared	Roberto da Costa and Natalino José Batista disappeared on 10 September 1992 in the Sapopemba district of Sao Paulo and have not been found despite searches conducted by family and human rights workers. Prior to his disappearance, Roberto da Costa had reported being shot at. Earlier in the year he had been detained and tortured by a military police patrol that accused him of stealing a tape recorder.
Colombia	José Del Carmen Alvarez Blanco	Farm worker	January 1990. Disappeared	Mr Alvarez was one of 43 men to be abducted by a squad of armed men, apparently in retaliation for the theft of 43 cattle from a local ranch. Police later searched the ranch and found common graves containing 24 bodies, but Mr Alvarez was not one of those identified by relatives.
El Salvador	Sara Cristina Chan Chan Medina	Trade Unionist	18 August 1989. Disappeared	Ms Chan Chan, a photographer working for the National Trade Union Federation of Salvadorian Workers and a member of the federation's women's committee, was 20 years old when she was detained by members of the Salvadorian air force on her way home from work. The Air Force later claimed she had been transferred to police custody, but the police denied holding her, and she has not been seen since.
Guatemala	María Rumalda Camey	Housewife / lay	15 August 1989.	Ms Camey, the sixth member of her family to have "disappeared" or

Country	Name	Profession	Last seen alive	Details
		religious activist	Disappeared	been killed by the security forces, had since 1985 been a member of the Mutual Support Group for the Appearance of our Relatives Alive. Heavily armed men burst into her house early in the morning and dragged her screaming from her husband and two small children. Her family has never seen her again.
India	Harjit Singh	Employee of Electricity Board	15 October 1992 (taken into custody 29 April 1992). Disappeared	A 22-year-old employee of the Punjab State Electricity Board, Mr Singh was arrested at a bus-stop by a group of police officers without a warrant. He was twice seen alive by his father, in police custody after the police claimed that he had been killed. The police have obstructed <i>habeas corpus</i> proceedings brought on Mr Singh's behalf, and the case is now subject to a judicial inquiry.
Indonesia/East Timor	Domingos Segurado	Teacher	12 November 1991	Mr. Segurado, a 28-year-old member of the non-violent resistance to Indonesian occupation of East Timor, was one of more than 200 people massacred at the Santa Cruz cemetery in Dili when Indonesian troops opened fire on a peaceful march for independence. He was the sole surviving member of his family: his parents and brothers had all been killed by the Indonesian army.
Iraq	Jabbar Rashid Shifki	Kurdish child	1983. Disappeared	Jabbar was 15 years old when he was arrested by the Iraqi army, one of hundreds of Kurdish children who "disappeared" at the same time. The children, whose families had been forcibly resettled in northern Iraq in the mid-1970s, were forced into military vehicles and driven away. Jabbar's fate and whereabouts are still unknown.
Israel/Occupied Territories	Najah Abu Dalal	Mother	Shot 21 April 1993; died in Shifa Hospital, 26 April 1993	Najah Abu Dalal, a 34-year-old mother of six, was shot on on 21 April 1993 in Nusayrat refugee camp in the Gaza Strip. She died five days later in hospital in Gaza City. According to relatives she had just sent her children to school and was in a narrow private courtyard of her house when she was hit in the head. The upper part of her body would have been visible to one or more Israeli soldiers stationed on top of a building overlooking her house from where the shot was said to come.

Country	Name	Profession	Last seen alive	Details
Kuwait	George Victor Salsa	Palestinian bank officer	May 1991. Disappeared	A Palestinian with Jordanian nationality, Mr Salsa was born in Kuwait in 1963. After the Gulf War he was arrested by the Kuwaiti secret police and taken to an unknown destination. In January 1992 there were reports that he was being held incommunicado in Kuwait Central Prison, and in August 1992 a doctor told his parents that he had seen their son, who had been severely tortured, in Kuwait's military hospital. Since then there has been no news of Mr Salsa.
Morocco and Western Sahara	Ahmed Lamaadal Mohamed-Mehdi El Bou	Former soldier in the Spanish army in the Western Sahara	15 April 1976. Disappeared	Mr Lemaadal El Bou was detained in Smara, one of the major towns in the Western Sahara, during a mass round-up of Sahrawi civilians suspected of supporting the opposition Polisario Front. He was 33 years old. Since then his wife and three sons have had no news of him but he, like others in Morocco, may still be alive, detained in some secret centre.
Myanmar	"Rahila" (pseudonym: 30 year old Muslim woman)	Day labourer	April 1991 Killed	Rahila was taken from her village along with others to be used by army troops as porters. She became ill when forced to carry a heavy load of rice on her back. (She is epileptic.) She fell; the soldiers kicked and punched her to make her get up, and when a fit prevented her, they beat her to death.
Peru	Marta Crisóstomo García	Nurse	8 September 1989. Killed	Ms García had given extensive evidence to the official inquiry into the May 1988 army massacre of some 30 Indian peasants in Cayara, and her name was widely published in the press. Though she moved to another town after receiving death threats, an army "death squad" broke into her house and shot her dead. Neighbours witnessed the army raid, but a police inquiry reported that there was no evidence to indicate who had killed her.
Philippines	Cris Batan	Human rights worker / tribal activist	23 February 1993. Killed	Mr Batan, aged 26, was killed on the road to Betwagan, where he was going to investigate past human rights violations. Six armed men opened fire on him and two other rights workers. He was hit in the leg and fell to the ground. The gunmen, members of a government-backed militia used by the military in

Country	Name	Profession	Last seen alive	Details
				counter-insurgency operations, moved nearer and shot him in the chest, then fled after threatening his colleagues. An investigation led only to threats against possible prosecution witnesses.
Rwanda	Michel Karambizi	Businessman	4 October 1990. Killed	Mr Karambizi, 45, was among some 1,000 people, most of them Tutsi, massacred by government soldiers trying to crush support for rebels. Rwandese soldiers raided his house and forced him, his wife and his 10-year-old child outside at gunpoint. All three were shot dead. There has been no news of any outcome of a judicial inquiry that the government claimed to have made into the killings.
South Africa	Bheki Mlangeni	Human rights lawyer	16 February 1991	Mr Mlangeni, aged 32, died when a bomb hidden in a cassette tape player exploded at his home in Soweto. He had been deeply involved in the investigation of alleged police and military "death squads" and circumstantial evidence suggests that it was they who were responsible for his killing. He was married with a young son.
Sri Lanka	Seenithamby Pillanayagam	Palm tree tapper	September 1990. Disappeared	A refugee with his wife and child from fierce fighting between troops and guerrillas, Mr Pillanayagam was one of 159 Tamil men and boys arrested in a raid on a refugee camp. They were forced into army trucks and driven off in front of thousands of witnesses, but the government has neither held an independent inquiry nor taken action against military personnel.
Sudan	Camillo Odongo Loyuk	Civil servant	July 1992. Killed	Mr Loyuk flew to Khartoum to see his two daughters safely into school, but the authorities suspected him of having fled his home to avoid detention for involvement in rebel attacks. He was taken to an interrogation centre in Khartoum where he was severely tortured and then beaten to death. The authorities deny that he was ever arrested.
Tadzhikistan	Muso Isoyev	Film actor/ ethnic minority activist	December 1992. Killed	Seized from a bus-stop in Dushanbe shortly after that city fell to government forces, Mr Isoyev was detained at gunpoint and driven off in an armoured car by armed troops. He was a well-known actor

Country	Name	Profession	Last seen alive	Details
				who had taken part in demonstrations against the President. On 20 December his bullet-riddled body was found on a street in Dushanbe.
Togo	Esther Kassakpo	Street seller	25 January 1993. Killed	Ms Kassakpo was about 25 years old, and a member of a women's organization affiliated with an opposition umbrella organization. She was shot dead by the security forces at a peaceful opposition demonstration in the capital, Lomé, where she was selling goods. Eighteen other civilians were also killed by security forces and more than 50 others wounded. Ms Kassakpo's family have reportedly fled in fear of reprisals. As political instability and violence have increased, hundreds of thousands of Togolese citizens have fled the country. Over ¼ million Togolese are now living as refugees.
Turkey	Resul Sakar	Opposition political activist / local imam	2 November 1992. Killed	Mr Sakar was a Workers' Party member who supported political freedom for the Kurds. Police officers and militia guards in plain clothes raided his house at midnight, when he was ill and in bed. They said he was wanted for interrogation and dragged him away still wearing his pyjamas. He was shot 15 times in the back, and his body was found the next morning in a neighbouring district.
Venezuela	Luis Enrique Landa Díaz	Medical student	17 September 1992. Killed	Luis Landa was helping to celebrate his medical school's 17th anniversary when there was a verbal altercation - at a distance - between some of the students and a group of National Guards. The guards fired tear gas at the students and later live ammunition. Mr Landa died of a gunshot wound to the head. A year after his killing nobody has been brought to justice and his father has been threatened and attacked for calling for the truth and justice.
Yemen	'Abd al Rahman 'Umar 'Abd al-Rahman Baljun	Writer and editor	1988 (taken into custody on 23 January 1986). Disappeared	Mr Baljun's colleagues at the Aden television studio where he worked took him into custody and handed him over to the state security police. He was later seen in various hospitals, reportedly having been so severely tortured that his back was broken and he was crippled from the waist down. Since he was last seen in military

Country	Name	Profession	Last seen alive	Details
				barracks near Aden his wife and four children have been unable to discover his whereabouts or his fate.
Croatia (former Yugoslavia)	Siniša Glavaševi_	Radio journalist	19 November 1991. Disappeared	Mr Glavaševi_, a 33-year-old husband and father, was one of many civilians who took refuge in the Vukovar hospital towards the end of the siege by the Yugoslav National Army (JNA). When the town surrendered, many of the civilians who were sheltering throughout the town were detained, ill-treated in JNA custody, and in many cases summarily executed. Mr Glavaševi_'s fate, as well as that of over 200 others who were in the hospital, remains unknown.

**TABLE 2: MEDICAL PERSONNEL: SELECTED CASES OF DISAPPEARANCE OR POLITICAL KILLINGS**

Country	Name	Profession	Last seen alive	Details
Colombia (See AMR 23/59/93 for further details)	Dr Armando Rodríguez Parrado, and Drs Alvaro Diego Escribano Edgar Roballo Quintano	doctors and hospital directors	11 September 1992. Disappeared  4 and 29 October Killed.	Dr Rodríguez was abducted from his residence in hospital grounds in Restrepo, Meta department, on 11 September 1992 by five masked armed men. Prior to his disappearance he had reported being followed and had received death threats. Nothing has been heard of him since his abduction.  In the same department of Meta two further doctors (both surgeons) were abducted and shot dead in the weeks that followed, Dr Roballo Quintero on 4 October and Dr Diego Escribano on 29 October. All three doctors were directors of local hospitals or clinics in Meta.
India (ASA 20/18/93)	Dr Farooq Ahmad Ashai	orthopaedic surgeon	18 February 1993. Killed	Dr Farooq Ahmad Ashai was a chief orthopaedic surgeon at the Bone and Joint Hospital in Srinagar, Kashmir, who had documented many cases of torture. He was shot dead at night on 18 February 1993 when travelling in his car past a picket of security forces, possibly the Central Reserve Police Force. Official reports



Country	Name	Profession	Last seen alive	Details
				that he died in "cross fire" are not known to have been substantiated.
South Africa (See AFR 53/15/93 for further details)	Dr Henry Vika Luthuli	doctor	Killed 1990. (Death threats have since been made against his wife, a nurse.)	General practitioner shot dead at his surgery in Esikhwini, Natal in August 1990, the victim of a politically-motivated assassination. Dr Luthuli was not politically active, but rumours had circulated that he had conducted post-mortems on the bodies of two "disappeared" boys discovered locally. He had not in fact conducted the autopsies but, as the families' GP, had treated the boys' parents for shock. Dr Luthuli's wife, a nursing sister, had been attempting unsuccessfully to move forward police investigations into her husband's murder, but in 1993 received death threats. [The SA government and police refused to investigate the death, claiming that it took place in the KwaZulu homeland and therefore outside SA jurisdiction.]
Turkey (See EUR 44/13/93 and EUR 44/23/93 for further details)	Dr Hasan Kaya	doctor	21 February 1993. Killed	Disappeared on 21 February 1993, together with a friend and lawyer Metin Can, after being called away from Metin Can's home by a phone call. Their dead bodies were found on 27 February some 120 km from their home town. Both had been shot with one bullet to the head. Their hands had been bound behind their backs, and their bodies bore signs of ill-treatment. Metin Can was chairman of the Human Rights Association (HRA) in Elazi_ in the southeast of Turkey where HRA members and those seen as sympathizing with the local Kurdish population have been the victims of threats and assassinations. Dr Kaya was a family friend.
Nepal (See ASA 31/03/92 for further details)	Dr Narayan Laxmi Jha	doctor	June 1985. Disappeared	Dr Jha was a medical practitioner in Janakpur who had been a vocal spokesman for his local community and had been detained previously for his criticism of the local administration. He was arrested in late June 1985 and initially held in Janakpur before being transferred, reportedly to Kathmandu. After a few weeks the police informed his family that he was no longer in their custody. Despite a <i>habeas corpus</i> petition and court orders to the police and Home Ministry to provide information on his whereabouts, Dr Jha remained disappeared and the police denied having held him.

Country	Name	Profession	Last seen alive	Details
				<p>Following political changes in 1990 when the country adopted a multi-party system of democratic government, a Commission was created to document disappearances between 1960 and 1990. Dr Jha's case was one of those investigated and, although some reports suggested that Dr Jha had been taken into police custody in Kathmandu, there has still been no light shed upon his fate.</p>

In addition to those cases where health personnel are killed or disappear, never to be seen again, there are some instances where individuals are abducted and subsequently reappear; there are also many instances where health workers are forced to flee after receiving death threats. Dr Carmen Angelica Valenzuela was a paediatrician and President of the Guatemalan Association of Women Doctors. She was also a professor at San Carlos University in Guatemala City and head of a hospital department. Dr Valenzuela was abducted in February 1990 by five or six armed men; her abduction followed a wave of abductions of students and staff from San Carlos University in mid-1989, who were either killed or "disappeared". San Carlos University had been seen as a centre of opposition to military rule during the 1980s. Dr Valenzuela is one of the few "disappeared" to have escaped alive in Guatemala. After being tortured she was released on 18 February 1990 following international outcry and subsequently she went into exile.

In Colombia, a doctor was obliged to leave the country after he became the subject of telephoned death threats. He began to receive these threats following his role in the search for three disappeared community leaders and his subsequent identification of their bodies which were found mutilated in October 1990.

In Turkey, death threats were made against Dr Ata Soyer, one of 28 on a published death list circulating in southeast Turkey in early 1992; two of those on the death list — a well-respected writer and a Kurdish MP — have since been shot dead, the writer while visiting Diyarbakir in September 1992 and the MP on 4 September 1993 in Batman, when he was killed in broad daylight together with the local Batman chairman of the Democracy Party. Those on the list were either Kurdish Members of Parliament or had in some way spoken out publicly on behalf of Turkey's Kurdish minority or investigated instances of human rights violations against them. Dr Soyer is believed to have been included in the list because he had been involved in providing aid to Iraqi Kurdish refugees who fled to Turkey at the time of the Gulf War. (See EUR 44/49/92.)

## Appendix 1: Selected bibliography on disappearances and extrajudicial executions

Americas Watch / Physicians for Human Rights. *Guatemala: Getting Away With Murder*. NY: Human Rights Watch, 1991; 85pp.+ appendix.

KEYWORDS: Guatemala / forensic / human rights / EJE / disappearance

Americas Watch / Physicians for Human Rights. *The Search for Brazil's Disappeared: The Mass Grave at Dom Bosco Cemetery*. New York: Americas Watch, 1991; 18pp.

KEYWORDS: Brazil / forensic / anthropology / excavation / EJE

Amnesty International. *Disappearances: a Workbook*. New York: AI Publications, 1981;

KEYWORDS: disappearances / sequelae

Amnesty International. *Extrajudicial executions in El Salvador*. Report of an Amnesty International mission to examine post-mortem and investigative procedures. London: AI Publications. 1984; 48pp.

KEYWORDS: El Salvador / EJE / forensic / investigations

Amnesty International. *Disappearances in Guatemala under the Government of Gen. Oscar Humberto Mejía Victores (Aug 1983-Jan 1985)*. AI Index: AMR 34/01/85, 1985.

KEYWORDS: disappearances / EJE / Guatemala

Amnesty International. *Amnesty International Report 1993*. AI Publications 1993; 354pp.

KEYWORDS: human rights / torture / EJE / DP / disappearance / CIDT / documentation

Amnesty International. *Brazil. Death has arrived: prison massacre at the Casa de Detenção, Sao Paulo*. AI Index: AMR 19/08/93, 1993; 32pp.

KEYWORDS: Brazil / EJE / forensic / autopsy / ballistics

Amnesty International. *Peru: Public Ministry rejects assistance of forensic experts in death investigation*.

AI Index: AMR 46/27/93, 1993.

KEYWORDS: Peru / EJE / disappearance / grave site / forensic / anthropology

Amnesty International. *Venezuela. Arbitrary killings in February/March 1989: victims exhumed from mass graves*. AI Index: AMR 53/02/91, 1991; 18pp.

KEYWORDS: Venezuela / EJE / forensic / anthropology

Amnesty International. *South Africa: State of Fear. Security force complicity in torture and political killings, 1990-1992*. AI Index: AFR 53/09/92, June 1992; 100 pp.

KEYWORDS: South Africa / EJE / police and military collusion

Amnesty International. *Turkey: Torture, extrajudicial executions and disappearances*. AI Index: EUR 44/39/92, May 1992.

KEYWORDS: Turkey / torture / EJE / disappearance

Amnesty International. *Sri Lanka: Extrajudicial executions, "disappearances" and torture 1987 to 1990*. AI Index: ASA 37/21/90, September 1992; 71 pp. + other papers, including *Killings of Muslim and Tamil villagers in eastern Sri Lanka*, June 1992 and *Unresolved disappearances from the period 1987-90: the case of Sevana Army Camp*, October 1991

KEYWORDS: Sri Lanka / EJE / disappearance.

Anonymous. Sudan: repression of doctors. *Lancet*, 1990; 336:1307.

KEYWORDS: Sudan / detained doctors / EJE / torture

CONADEP. *Nunca Mas: A Report by Argentina's Commission on Disappeared People*. London: Faber and Faber, 1986;

KEYWORDS: disappearance / EJE / torture / doctor / ethics / Argentina

Di Lonardo AM, Darlu P, Baur M et al. Human genetics and human rights: identifying the families of kidnapped children. *American J of Forensic Medicine and Pathology*, 1984; 5:339-48.

KEYWORDS: human rights / genetics / disappearance / Argentina /

Green MA. Sudden and suspicious deaths outside the deceased's own country - time for an international protocol. *Forensic Science International*, 1982; 20:71-5.

KEYWORDS: death / investigation / forensic / protocol

Guest I. *Behind the Disappearances: Argentina's Dirty War Against Human Rights and the United Nations*. Philadelphia: University of Philadelphia Press, 1990; 605pp.

KEYWORDS: disappearance / torture / human rights / UN / Argentina

Jandoo R. Human rights abuses and the medical profession. *Forensic Science International*, 1987; 35:237-47.

KEYWORDS: forensic / human rights / documentation / torture / EJE

Joyce C, Stover E. *Witnesses from the Grave: The Stories Bones Tell*. NY: Ballantine Books, 1991; 322pp.

KEYWORDS: forensic / anthropology / history / Argentina /disappearance

King M-C. An application of DNA sequencing to a human rights problem. *Molecular Genetic Medicine*, 1991; 1:117-31.

KEYWORDS: Argentina/disappearance/genetics/children

Kordon D. Impunity's psychological effects: its ethical consequences. *Journal of Medical Ethics* (supplement), 1991; 17(S):29-32.

KEYWORDS: Argentina / disappearance / impunity / ethics / Madres

Kordon DR, Edelman LI et al. *Efectos psicológicos de la represión*. Buenos Aires: Sudamericana-Planeta, 1986; 180pp.

KEYWORDS: therapy / disappearance / Argentina / psychoanalysis

Kordon DR, Edelman LI, Lagos D et al. Torture in Argentina. In: Basoglu M (ed), *Torture and its Consequences*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992; 433-51.

KEYWORDS: Argentina / disappearance / impunity / ethics / therapy

Levine LJ. The role of the forensic odontologist in human rights investigations. *American J of Forensic Medicine and Pathology*, 1984; 5:317-24.

KEYWORDS: human rights / forensic / odontology / investigation / autopsy

Physicians for Human Rights, Asia Watch. *Bloody May: The Events of May 17-20, 1992*. Boston: PHR, 1992.

KEYWORDS: Thailand / demonstration / EJE / autopsy / mission

Physicians for Human Rights. *Kenya: Medicolegal Aspects of the Inquest into the Death of Peter Ngauja*. Somerville: PHR, 1988, 14pp.

KEYWORDS: Kenya / forensic / death in custody / missions / inquest

Physicians for Human Rights. *Winds of Death: Iraq's Use of Poison Gas Against its Kurdish Population*. Somerville: PHR, 1989, 40 pp.

KEYWORDS: Iraq / Kurds / chemical weapons / missions / EJE

Simpson J, Bennett J. *The Disappeared*. London: Sphere, 1986; 400pp.

KEYWORDS: disappearance / Argentina

Skinner M. Planning the archaeological recovery of evidence from recent mass graves. *Forensic Science International*, 1987; 34:267-87.

KEYWORDS: forensic / archaeology / investigation / graves

Sluzki CE. Disappeared: semantic and somatic effects of political repression in a family seeking therapy. *Family Process*, 1990; 29:131-43.

KEYWORDS: disappearance / therapy

Snow CC et al. The investigation of the human remains of the "disappeared" in Argentina. *American J of Forensic Medicine and Pathology*, 1984; 5:297-99.

KEYWORDS: Argentina/ disappearance / forensic / anthropology

Sottas E, Bron E. *Exactions et Enfants*. Geneva: Organisation Mondiale Contre la Torture, 1993; 77pp + annex.

KEYWORDS: children / torture / EJE / disappearance / transplant / OMCT

Stover E, Nightingale EO (eds.). *The Breaking of Bodies and Minds: Torture, Psychiatric Abuse, and the Health Professions*. New York: WH Freeman & Company, 1985; 336pp.

KEYWORDS: torture / psychiatry / ethics / human rights / disappearance

Tedeschi L. Methodology in the forensic sciences: documentation of human rights abuses. *American J of Forensic Medicine and Pathology*, 1984; 5:301-4.

KEYWORDS: human rights / autopsy / investigation / forensic

Thomsen JL, Gruschow J, Stover E. Medicolegal investigation of political killings in El Salvador. *Lancet*, 1989; i:1377-9.

KEYWORDS: El Salvador / forensic / EJE

Thomsen JL, Helweg-Larsen K, Rasmussen O. Amnesty International and the forensic sciences. *American J of Forensic Medicine and Pathology*, 1984; 5:305-11.

KEYWORDS: AI / forensic / human rights

Thomsen JL, Voigt J. Forensic medicine and human rights. *Forensic Science International*, 1988; 36:147-51.

KEYWORDS: human rights / forensic

United Nations. *Manual on the Effective Prevention and Investigation of Extra-legal, Arbitrary and Summary Executions*. New York: United Nations, 1991; 71pp.

KEYWORDS: autopsy / investigation / EJE / enquiry / forensic

Zwi A, Ugalde A. Towards an epidemiology of political violence in the Third World. *Social Science and Medicine*, 1989; 28:633-42.

KEYWORDS: human rights / EJE / torture / public health / CIDT

**Appendix 2:**  
**14-Point Program for the Prevention of**  
**Extrajudicial Executions**  
(Amnesty International, 1992)

*Extrajudicial executions are fundamental violations of human rights and an affront to the conscience of humanity. These unlawful and deliberate killings, carried out by order of a government or with its complicity or acquiescence, have been condemned by the United Nations. Yet extrajudicial executions continue, daily and across the globe.*

*Many of the victims have been taken into custody or made to "disappear" before being killed. Some are killed in their homes, or in the course of military operations. Some are assassinated by uniformed members of the security forces, or by "death squads" operating with official connivance. Others are killed in peaceful demonstrations.*

*The accountability of governments for extrajudicial executions is not diminished by the commission of similar abhorrent acts by armed opposition groups. Urgent action is needed to stop extrajudicial executions and bring those responsible to justice.*

*Amnesty International calls on all governments to implement the following 14-Point Program for the Prevention of Extrajudicial Executions. It invites concerned individuals and organizations to join in promoting the program. Amnesty International believes that the implementation of these measures is a positive indication of a government's commitment to stop extrajudicial executions and to work for their eradication worldwide.*

**1. Official condemnation**

The highest authorities of every country should demonstrate their total opposition to extrajudicial executions. They should make clear to all members of the police, military and other security forces that extrajudicial executions will not be tolerated under any circumstances.

**2. Chain-of-command control**

Those in charge of the security forces should maintain strict chain-of-command control to ensure that officers under their command do not commit extrajudicial executions. Officials with chain-of-command responsibility who order or tolerate extrajudicial executions by those under their command should be held criminally responsible for these acts.

**3. Restraints on use of force**

Governments should ensure that law enforcement officials use force only when strictly necessary and only to the minimum extent required under the circumstances. Lethal force should not be used except when strictly unavoidable in order to protect life.

**4. Action against "death squads"**

"Death squads", private armies, criminal gangs and paramilitary forces operating outside the chain of command but with official support or acquiescence should be prohibited and disbanded. Members of such groups who have perpetrated extrajudicial executions should be brought to justice.

**5. Protection against death threats**

Governments should ensure that anyone in danger of extrajudicial execution, including those who receive death threats, is effectively protected.

**6. No secret detention**

Governments should ensure that prisoners are held only in publicly recognized places of detention and that accurate information about the arrest and detention of any prisoner is made available promptly to relatives, lawyers and the courts. No one should be secretly detained.

**7. Access to prisoners**

All prisoners should be brought before a judicial authority without delay after being taken into custody. Relatives, lawyers and doctors should have prompt and regular access to them. There should be regular, independent, unannounced and unrestricted visits of inspection to all places of detention.

**8. Prohibition in law**

Governments should ensure that the commission of an extrajudicial execution is a criminal offence, punishable by sanctions commensurate with the gravity of the practice. The prohibition of extrajudicial executions and the essential safeguards for their prevention must not be suspended under any circumstances, including states of war or other public emergency.

**9. Individual responsibility**

The prohibition of extrajudicial executions should be reflected in the training of all officials involved in the arrest and custody of prisoners and all officials authorized to use lethal force, and in the instructions issued to them. These officials should be instructed that they have the right and duty to refuse to obey any order to participate in an extrajudicial execution. An order from a superior officer or a public authority must never be invoked as a justification for taking part in an extrajudicial execution.

**10. Investigation**

Governments should ensure that all complaints and reports of extrajudicial executions are investigated promptly, impartially and effectively by a body which is independent of those allegedly responsible and has the necessary powers and resources to carry out the investigation. The methods and findings of the investigation should be made public. The body of the alleged victim should not be disposed of until an adequate autopsy has been conducted by a suitably qualified doctor who is able to function impartially.



Officials suspected of responsibility for extrajudicial executions should be suspended from active duty during the investigation. Relatives of the victim should have access to information relevant to the investigation, should be entitled to appoint their own doctor to carry out or be present at an autopsy, and should be entitled to present evidence. Complainants, witnesses, lawyers, judges and others involved in the investigation should be protected from intimidation and reprisals.

#### **11. Prosecution**

Governments should ensure that those responsible for extrajudicial executions are brought to justice. This principle should apply wherever such people happen to be, wherever the crime was committed, whatever the nationality of the perpetrators or victims and no matter how much time has elapsed since the commission of the crime. Trials should be in the civilian courts. The perpetrators should not be allowed to benefit from any legal measures exempting them from criminal prosecution or conviction.

#### **12. Compensation**

Dependants of victims of extrajudicial execution should be entitled to obtain fair and adequate redress from the state, including financial compensation.

#### **13. Ratification of human rights treaties and implementation of international standards**

All governments should ratify international treaties containing safeguards and remedies against extrajudicial executions, including the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and its first Optional Protocol which provides for individual complaints. Governments should ensure full implementation of the relevant provisions of these and other international instruments, including the UN Principles on the Effective Prevention and Investigation of Extra-Legal, Arbitrary and Summary Executions, and comply with the recommendations of intergovernmental organizations concerning these abuses.

#### **14. International responsibility**

Governments should use all available channels to intercede with the governments of countries where extrajudicial executions have been reported. They should ensure that training and transfers of equipment, know-how and training for military, security or police use do not facilitate extrajudicial executions. No one should be forcibly returned to a country where he or she risks becoming a victim of extrajudicial execution.

Appendix 3:  
**14-Point Program for the Prevention  
of "Disappearances"**

(Amnesty International, 1992)

The "disappeared" are people who have been taken into custody by agents of the state, yet whose whereabouts and fate are concealed, and whose custody is denied. "Disappearances" cause agony for the victims and their relatives. The victims are cut off from the world and placed outside the protection of the law; often they are tortured; many are never seen again. Their relatives are kept in ignorance, unable to find out whether the victims are alive or dead.

The United Nations has condemned "disappearances" as a grave violation of human rights and has said that their systematic practice is of the nature of a crime against humanity. Yet thousands of people "disappear" each year across the globe, and countless others remain "disappeared". Urgent action is needed to stop "disappearances", to clarify the fate of the "disappeared" and to bring those responsible to justice.

Amnesty International calls on all governments to implement the following 14-Point Program for the Prevention of "Disappearances". It invites concerned individuals and organizations to join in promoting the program. Amnesty International believes that the implementation of these measures is a positive indication of a government's commitment to stop "disappearances" and to work for their eradication worldwide.

**1. Official condemnation**

The highest authorities of every country should demonstrate their total opposition to "disappearances". They should make clear to all members of the police, military and other security forces that "disappearances" will not be tolerated under any circumstances.

**2. Chain-of-command control**

Those in charge of the security forces should maintain strict chain-of-command control to ensure that officers under their command do not commit "disappearances". Officials with chain-of-command responsibility who order or tolerate "disappearances" by those under their command should be held criminally responsible for these acts.

**3. Information on detention and release**

Accurate information about the arrest of any person and about his or her place of detention, including transfers and releases, should be made available promptly to relatives, lawyers and the courts. Prisoners should be released in a way that allows reliable verification of their release and ensures their safety.

**4. Mechanism for locating and protecting prisoners**

Governments should at all times ensure that effective judicial remedies are available which enable relatives and lawyers to find out immediately where a prisoner is held and under what authority, to ensure his or her safety, and to obtain the release of anyone arbitrarily detained.

**5. No secret detention**

Governments should ensure that prisoners are held only in publicly recognized places of detention. Up-to-date registers of all prisoners should be maintained in every place of detention and centrally. The information in these registers should be made available to relatives, lawyers, judges, official bodies trying to trace people who have been detained, and others with a legitimate interest. No one should be secretly detained.

#### **6. Authorization of arrest and detention**

Arrest and detention should be carried out only by officials who are authorized by law to do so. Officials carrying out an arrest should identify themselves to the person arrested and, on demand, to others witnessing the event. Governments should establish rules setting forth which officials are authorized to order an arrest or detention. Any deviation from established procedures which contributes to a "disappearance" should be punished by appropriate sanctions.

#### **7. Access to prisoners**

All prisoners should be brought before a judicial authority without delay after being taken into custody. Relatives, lawyers and doctors should have prompt and regular access to them. There should be regular, independent, unannounced and unrestricted visits of inspection to all places of detention.

#### **8. Prohibition in law**

Governments should ensure that the commission of a "disappearance" is a criminal offence, punishable by sanctions commensurate with the gravity of the practice. The prohibition of "disappearances" and the essential safeguards for their prevention must not be suspended under any circumstances, including states of war or other public emergency.

#### **9. Individual responsibility**

The prohibition of "disappearances" should be reflected in the training of all officials involved in the arrest and custody of prisoners and in the instructions issued to them. They should be instructed that they have the right and duty to refuse to obey any order to participate in a "disappearance". An order from a superior officer or a public authority must never be invoked as a justification for taking part in a "disappearance".

#### **10. Investigation**

Governments should ensure that all complaints and reports of "disappearances" are investigated promptly, impartially and effectively by a body which is independent of those allegedly responsible and has the necessary powers and resources to carry out the investigation. The methods and findings of the investigation should be made public. Officials suspected of responsibility for "disappearances" should be suspended from active duty during the investigation. Relatives of the victim should have access to information relevant to the investigation and should be entitled to present evidence. Complainants, witnesses, lawyers and others involved in the investigation should be protected from intimidation and reprisals. The investigation should not be curtailed until the fate of the victim is officially clarified.

#### **11. Prosecution**

Governments should ensure that those responsible for "disappearances" are brought to justice. This principle should apply wherever such people happen to be, wherever the crime was committed, whatever the nationality of the perpetrators or victims and no matter how much time has elapsed since the

commission of the crime. Trials should be in the civilian courts. The perpetrators should not benefit from any legal measures exempting them from criminal prosecution or conviction.

**12. Compensation and rehabilitation**

Victims of "disappearance" and their dependants should be entitled to obtain fair and adequate redress from the state, including financial compensation. Victims who reappear should be provided with appropriate medical care or rehabilitation.

**13. Ratification of human rights treaties and implementation of international standards**

All governments should ratify international treaties containing safeguards and remedies against "disappearances", including the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and its first Optional Protocol which provides for individual complaints. Governments should ensure full implementation of the relevant provisions of these and other international instruments, including the UN Declaration on the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance, and comply with the recommendations of intergovernmental organizations concerning these abuses.

**14. International responsibility**

Governments should use all available channels to intercede with the governments of countries where "disappearances" have been reported. They should ensure that transfers of equipment, know-how and training for military, security or police use do not facilitate "disappearances". No one should be forcibly returned to a country where he or she risks being made to "disappear".